

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

Minutes of the Meeting of the Forty-First Council of the Phi Beta Kappa Society .....	1
First Plenary Session.....	14
Small-Group Sessions.....	18
Second Plenary Session .....	20
Third Plenary Session .....	23
Council Symposium.....	32
Council Banquet.....	35
Minutes of the District Meetings .....	39
New England District.....	39
Middle Atlantic District .....	41
South Atlantic District .....	44
East Central District.....	48
North Central District .....	51
South Central District .....	55
Western District .....	57
Report of the Conference of Association Delegates .....	61
The Phi Beta Kappa Society .....	66
Officers and Senators.....	66
The Phi Beta Kappa Foundation.....	67
The Phi Beta Kappa Fellows.....	68
<i>The Key Reporter</i> .....	69
<i>The American Scholar</i> .....	69
The Phi Beta Kappa Society Staff .....	70

**THE PHI BETA KAPPA SOCIETY**  
1606 New Hampshire Avenue NW  
Washington DC 20009  
202 265 3808  
Fax 202 986 1601  
[www.pbk.org](http://www.pbk.org)



*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE  
FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL**

**October 24-29, 2006**

The 41st Triennial Council of the Phi Beta Kappa Society met in Atlanta, Georgia, on October 24-29, 2006, at the Westin Peachtree Plaza. In addition to three plenary sessions, there were meetings of the Phi Beta Kappa Senate, its Executive Committee, the District officers, the Association Delegates, Chapter Delegates, and the Council committees. Delegates also convened in small-group sessions to discuss the concerns and activities of the Society. The Visiting Scholar Program celebrated its 50th anniversary with a series of Symposia.

The following members were officially in attendance at the 41st Council:

Niall W. Slater, President  
Donald S. Lamm, Vice President

John Churchill, Secretary  
John Page, Treasurer

**SENATORS**

Charles H. Adams  
Bruce R. Barrett  
Catherine White Berheide  
Allison Blakely  
Fred Harrison Cate  
Eloise Clark  
John Doner  
Theopolis Fair  
Kathleen Gensheimer  
Madeline E. Glick

Joseph W. Gordon  
Alonzo Hamby  
Harvey E. Klehr  
Judith F. Krug  
Kurt Olsson  
Carol Race  
Catherine E. Rudder  
Pauline Yu  
Don J. Wyatt

**PAST PRESIDENTS**

Frederick J. Crosson  
Joseph W. Gordon

**PAST SECRETARIES**

Douglas W. Foard  
Kenneth Greene

## MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL

### CHAPTER DELEGATES

Agnes Scott College, Beta of Georgia – Calvert Berry Johnson  
Alabama, University of, Alpha of Alabama – [ ]  
Albion College, Beta of Michigan – Daniel M. Steffenson  
Alfred University, Alpha Beta of New York – Susan Rumsey Strong  
Allegheny College, Eta of Pennsylvania – Sonia Esterly Parry  
Alma College, Eta of Michigan – Michael Layne Selmon  
American University, Zeta of the District of Columbia – Naomi S. Baron  
Amherst College, Beta of Massachusetts – Gerald Marvin Mager  
Arizona, University of, Alpha of Arizona – Jeanne Nienaber Clarke  
Arizona State University, Beta of Arizona – Sanford J. Cohn  
Arkansas, University of, Alpha of Arkansas – Charles H. Adams; David W. Hart  
Auburn University, Gamma of Alabama – Robert Warner Widell  
Augustana College, Zeta of Illinois – [ ]  
Austin College, Iota of Texas – Roderick Milford Stewart  
Bates College, Gamma of Maine – [ ]  
Baylor University, Zeta of Texas – Marian Mikaylo Ortuño; Phillip Johnson  
Beloit College, Beta of Wisconsin – [ ]  
Birmingham–Southern College, Beta of Alabama – Susan Hagen  
Boston College, Omicron of Massachusetts – Clare M. O'Connor  
Boston University, Epsilon of Massachusetts – Wayne Snyder  
Bowdoin College, Alpha of Maine – James E. Ward  
Bowling Green State University, Xi of Ohio – Geoffrey C. Howes, II  
Brandeis University, Mu of Massachusetts – Caldwell Titcomb  
Brown University, Alpha of Rhode Island – [ ]  
Bucknell University, Mu of Pennsylvania – [ ]  
California, University of,  
    Berkeley, Alpha of California – Daniel F. Melia  
    Davis, Kappa of California – Barbara Ann Horwitz  
    Irvine, Mu of California – [ ]  
    Los Angeles, Eta of California – Sharon Louise Underdahl  
    Riverside, Iota of California – [ ]  
    San Diego, Sigma of California – Kathleen French  
    Santa Barbara, Lambda of California – John E. Doner  
    Santa Cruz, Upsilon of California – Naomi Anne Brokaw  
California State University, Long Beach, Rho of California – Richard Patrick Haesly, Ph.D.  
Carleton College, Beta of Minnesota – Lawrence Leo Archbold  
Carnegie Mellon University, Upsilon of Pennsylvania – Joseph Edward Devine  
Case Western Reserve University, Alpha of Ohio – Margaret B. Robinson  
Catholic University, Beta of the District of Columbia – [ ]  
Centre College, Beta of Kentucky – [ ]  
Chatham College, Omicron of Pennsylvania – Charlotte Lott  
Chicago, University of, Beta of Illinois – [ ]  
Cincinnati, University of, Delta of Ohio – Robert C. Fee  
Claremont McKenna College, Tau of California – [ ]  
Clark University, Lambda of Massachusetts – [ ]  
Coe College, Epsilon of Iowa – Calvin Van Niewaal; Wendy Schreck Dunn  
Colby College, Beta of Maine – Thomas Robert Berger

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

Colgate University, Eta of New York – George Hudson, Jr.  
Colorado College, Beta of Colorado – Theodore G. Lindeman  
Colorado, University of, Alpha of Colorado – Susan Hukill Prince; Roy Jerome Peterson  
Colorado State University, Delta of Colorado – Diane Claire Margolf  
Columbia University, The College; Delta of New York – Roger Lehecka  
Sections:  
    Barnard College – [ ]  
    School of General Studies – [ ]  
Connecticut College, Delta of Connecticut – [ ]  
Connecticut, University of, Epsilon of Connecticut – Jocelyn S. Linnekin  
Cornell College, Delta of Iowa – Martha Ann Condon  
Cornell University, Theta of New York – David Grossvogel  
Dallas, University of, Eta of Texas – Eileen Gregory  
Dartmouth College, Alpha of New Hampshire – Katherine Soule  
Davidson College, Gamma of North Carolina – Merlyn D. Schuh  
Delaware, University of, Alpha of Delaware – [ ]  
Denison University, Theta of Ohio – Charles Wayne Sokolik  
Denver, University of, Gamma of Colorado – Todd Richard Breyfogle; Dennis Barrett  
DePauw University, Alpha of Indiana – Theresa Anne Marie Noble  
Dickinson College, Alpha of Pennsylvania – [ ]  
Drake University, Gamma of Iowa – [ ]  
Drew University, Gamma of New Jersey – [ ]  
Duke University, Beta of North Carolina – Rhett T. George, Jr.  
Earlham College, Delta of Indiana – Alice Almond Shrock  
Eckerd College, Zeta of Florida – Catherine Griggs  
Elmira College, Pi of New York – Margaret Arnesen  
Emory University, Gamma of Georgia – Ed Wayne Stansell; Ryan Erich Plocher  
Fairfield University, Zeta of Connecticut – Edward John O'Neill; Lisa Haenlein Newton  
Fisk University, Delta of Tennessee – James A. Quirin  
Florida, University of, Beta of Florida – Andrew M. Gordon  
Florida International University, Epsilon of Florida – Rosemary L. Hickey-Vargas  
Florida State University, Alpha of Florida – David High Darst  
Fordham University, Tau of New York – Joseph Koterski  
Franklin and Marshall College, Theta of Pennsylvania – Joseph Houser  
Furman University, Gamma of South Carolina – [ ]  
George Washington University, Alpha of the District of Columbia – Jill F. Kasle  
Georgetown University, Delta of the District of Columbia – Douglas McCabe; Linn Donaldson  
Georgia, University of, Alpha of Georgia – [ ]  
Gettysburg College, Iota of Pennsylvania – Daniel Gilbert, Jr.  
Goucher College, Beta of Maryland – Judy R. Levin; Hilda Fisher; Jacqueline V. Waldman  
Grinnell College, Beta of Iowa – [ ]  
Gustavus Adolphus College, Eta of Minnesota – Elizabeth A. Jenner  
Hamilton College, Epsilon of New York – Tara McKee  
Hamline University, Zeta of Minnesota – Arthur A. Guetter  
Hampden–Sydney College, Eta of Virginia – Liz Rand  
Harvard University, Alpha–Iota of Massachusetts – Judith Eisenberg Vichniac  
Haverford College, Zeta of Pennsylvania – [ ]  
Hawaii, University of, at Manoa, Alpha of Hawaii – Stephen Canham; Todd Hunter Sammons  
Hendrix College, Beta of Arkansas – Britt Anne Murphy

*MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL*

Hiram College, Mu of Ohio – David Rollin Anderson  
Hobart and William Smith Colleges, Zeta of New York – Stefan Senders  
Hofstra University, Omega of New York, – [ ]  
Hollins College, Iota of Virginia – [ ]  
Holy Cross, College of the, Pi of Massachusetts – [ ]  
Hope College, Zeta of Michigan – Kelly T. Osborne  
Howard University, Gamma of the District of Columbia – Jeanne Maddox Toungara; Teresa M. Redd  
Idaho, University of, Alpha of Idaho – Kurt Olsson  
Illinois College, Epsilon of Illinois – Bernd Klaus Estabrook  
Illinois Wesleyan University, Lambda of Illinois – Sarah Elizabeth George  
Illinois, University of,  
    Chicago, Iota of Illinois – Josephine A. Volpe  
    Urbana–Champaign, Gamma of Illinois – Mark Hasegawa–Johnson  
Indiana University, Gamma of Indiana – J. Albert Harrill; David Bernhard Brakke  
Iowa, University of, Alpha of Iowa – Julie Claus  
Iowa State University, Zeta of Iowa – [ ]  
Johns Hopkins University, Alpha of Maryland – Stuart W. Leslie  
Kalamazoo College, Delta of Michigan – Joe Fugate  
Kansas State University, Beta of Kansas – Christopher C. Smith; Ann A. Warren; Stephen Wayne Kiefer  
Kansas, University of, Alpha of Kansas – Janet Riley  
Kent State University, Nu of Ohio – Daniel Keith Holm  
Kentucky, University of, Alpha of Kentucky – [ ]  
Kenyon College, Beta of Ohio – Sarah J. Heidt  
Knox College, Delta of Illinois – [ ]  
Lafayette College, Gamma of Pennsylvania – J. Randolph Stonesifer  
Lake Forest College, Theta of Illinois – Jill Van Newenhizen  
Lawrence University, Gamma–Delta of Wisconsin – Kurt Donald Krebsbach  
Lehigh University, Beta of Pennsylvania – Norman Girardot  
Lewis and Clark College, Gamma of Oregon – Roger Bain Nelsen  
Louisiana State University, Beta of Louisiana – Claire D. Advokat, Ph.D.  
Loyola College, Epsilon of Maryland – Paul Lukacs  
Loyola University, Kappa of Illinois – Fred Hines Smith  
Luther College, Eta of Iowa – [ ]  
Macalester College, Epsilon of Minnesota – Philip A. Lee, Jr.  
Maine, University of, Delta of Maine – Howard P. Segal; Kathryn J. Olmstead  
Manhattan College, Upsilon of New York – Jay Friedenber  
Marietta College, Gamma of Ohio – Kathryn Noble McDaniel  
Marquette University, Zeta of Wisconsin – Julia Carolyn Paulk  
Mary Baldwin College, Lambda of Virginia – Louise Freeman Davis  
Mary Washington, University of, Kappa of Virginia – Charlotte Johnson Jones  
Maryland, University of,  
    Baltimore County, Eta of Maryland – Jay M. Freyman  
    College Park, Gamma of Maryland – William Taft Stuart  
Massachusetts, University of, Nu of Massachusetts – Joseph Francis Bartolomeo  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Xi of Massachusetts – Kimberly Benard  
McDaniel College, Delta of Maryland – David Webb Herlocker; James Lightner  
Miami, University of, Delta of Florida – [ ]  
Miami University, Iota of Ohio – William H. Hardesty, III  
Michigan, University of, Alpha of Michigan – Ann E. Larimore

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

Michigan State University, Epsilon of Michigan – Emily Zack Tabuteau  
Middlebury College, Beta of Vermont – Don J. Wyatt  
Mills College, Zeta of California – Fred H. Lawson  
Millsaps College, Alpha of Mississippi – Eric John Griffin  
Minnesota, University of, Alpha of Minnesota – Gordon Dan Hirsch  
Mississippi, University of, Beta of Mississippi – Maribeth Stolzenburg  
Missouri, University of, Alpha of Missouri – Walter A. Schroeder  
Morehouse College, Delta of Georgia – Curtis Clark; David Edward Morrow  
Mount Holyoke College, Theta of Massachusetts – [ ]  
Muhlenberg College, Pi of Pennsylvania – – Amber Vanderwarker  
Nebraska, University of, Alpha of Nebraska – Janet Kepner Jensen; Kathleen Anne Johnson  
New Hampshire, University of, Beta of New Hampshire – Linda Barbara Johnson  
New Mexico, University of, Alpha of New Mexico – [ ]  
New York, City University of, (CUNY)  
    Brooklyn College, Rho of New York – Keith Harrow  
    City College, Gamma of New York [ ]  
    Herbert H. Lehman College, Chi of New York – Gary Schwartz  
    Hunter College, CUNY, Nu of New York – C. Howard Krukofsky; Rebecca Connor; Vera Junkers  
    Queens College, Sigma of New York – Thomas E. Bird  
New York, State University of, (SUNY)  
    Albany, Alpha Alpha of New York – Malcolm Jay Sherman  
    Binghamton, Psi of New York – [ ]  
    Buffalo, Omicron of New York – Barbara Jane Bono  
    Geneseo, Alpha Delta of New York – Thomas Allen Greenfield; William Cook  
    Stony Brook, Alpha Beta of New York – Ann-Marie Scheidt  
New York University, Beta of New York – John Delgrosso  
North Carolina, University of,  
    Chapel Hill, Alpha of North Carolina – Robert Paul Lowman  
    Greensboro, Epsilon of North Carolina – Alice E. Haddy  
North Carolina State University, Zeta of North Carolina – Tom Ralph Wentworth  
North Dakota, University of, Alpha of North Dakota – Ellen S. Erickson  
Northwestern University, Alpha of Illinois – [ ]  
Notre Dame, University of, Epsilon of Indiana – Frederick J. Crosson  
Oberlin College, Zeta of Ohio – Robert F. Geitz  
Occidental College, Delta of California – Maureen McRae Levy  
Ohio State University, Epsilon of Ohio – Mary Ellen Bigler Jenkins  
Ohio University, Lambda of Ohio – Christine Ann Fidler; Alonzo Hamby  
Ohio Wesleyan University, Eta of Ohio – Joseph F. Musser, Jr.  
Oklahoma, University of, Alpha of Oklahoma – Daniel Clair Snell  
Oregon, University of, Alpha of Oregon – [ ]  
Pennsylvania, University of, Delta of Pennsylvania – Janet Tighe  
Pennsylvania State University, Lambda of Pennsylvania – Catherine Grigor  
Pittsburgh, University of, Xi of Pennsylvania – Paul Shepard  
Pomona College, Gamma of California – Wayne Edward Steinmetz  
Princeton University, Beta of New Jersey – Peter Quimby  
Puget Sound, University of, Delta of Washington – William Henry Beardsley; Carrie S. Washburn  
Purdue University, Zeta of Indiana – [ ]  
Randolph–Macon College, Zeta of Virginia – Mark Rahm Malin  
Randolph–Macon Woman’s College, Delta of Virginia – [ ]

*MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL*

Redlands, University of, Xi of California – Steven William Morics  
Reed College, Beta of Oregon – [ ]  
Rhode Island, University of, Beta of Rhode Island – Lynn C. Pasquerella; Katie M. Wood  
Rhodes College, Gamma of Tennessee – Judith Patricia Haas  
Rice University, Beta of Texas – Robert Lowry Patten  
Richmond, University of, Epsilon of Virginia – Frank Edwin Eakin, Jr.  
Ripon College, Epsilon of Wisconsin – [ ]  
Roanoke College, Nu of Virginia – Jennifer Berenson Maclean; Mary Faulhaber Camac; Gilbert Dunn  
Rochester, University of, Iota of New York – Sanford L. Segal  
Rockford College, Eta of Illinois – Jules Gleicher  
Rutgers, The State University, Alpha of New Jersey, Sections:  
    Douglas College – Marjorie Munson  
    Newark College – Edward Boylan  
Saint Joseph's University, Phi of Pennsylvania – [ ]  
Saint Mary's College, Zeta of Maryland – James Roy Hopkins  
Saint Olaf College, Delta of Minnesota – Robert E. Entenmann  
San Diego, University of, Phi of California – Lisa Morrison Baird  
San Diego State University, Nu of California – E. Nicholas Genovese  
San Francisco State University, Omicron of California – Betty Jane Blecha  
Santa Clara University, Pi of California – Greg Corning  
Scripps College, Theta of California – Dalton Krauss  
Skidmore College, Phi of New York – Catherine Berheide; Mark Huibregtse  
Smith College, Zeta of Massachusetts – William Bruce Hawkins  
South, University of the, Beta of Tennessee – Stephen Ray Miller; Katherine Lehman  
South Carolina, University of, Alpha of South Carolina – Eric Holt  
South Dakota, University of, Alpha of South Dakota – Judith L. Sebesta  
Southern California, University of, Epsilon of California – Robin Guy–Michel Romans  
Southern Methodist University, Gamma of Texas – Diana Clark Grumbles  
Southwestern University, Theta of Texas – Alexandra Anderson  
Spelman College, Epsilon of Georgia – Barbara Carter  
Saint Catherine, College of, Gamma of Minnesota – Kelly Therese Winters  
Saint Lawrence University, Lambda of New York – [ ]  
Saint Louis University, Gamma of Missouri – Patrick Gilbert McCarthy  
Saint Michael's College, Gamma of Vermont – John Peter Kenney, Jr.  
Stanford University, Beta of California – Peter Stansky  
Stetson University, Gamma of Florida – Grady Woodfin Ballenger  
Swarthmore College, Epsilon of Pennsylvania – Stephen Maurer  
Sweet Briar College, Theta of Virginia – [ ]  
Syracuse University, Kappa of New York – Kay Fiset  
Temple University, Rho of Pennsylvania – Christopher Wolfgang  
Tennessee, University of, at Austin, Epsilon of Tennessee – Jeffrey Kovac  
Texas, University of, Alpha of Texas – Kenneth M. Ralls; Robert Charles Koons  
Texas A&M University, Kappa of Texas – Mary Jo Richardson; Comer O. Patterson; David Lee Carlson  
Texas Christian University, Delta of Texas – Nadia M. Lahutsky  
Trinity College, Beta of Connecticut – Daniel Richard Heischman  
Trinity University, Epsilon of the District of Columbia – Sandra H. Oyewole  
Trinity University, Epsilon of Texas – Richard Vernon Butler  
Truman State University, Delta of Missouri – Charles E. Breed  
Tufts University, Delta of Massachusetts – [ ]



*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

Tulane University, Alpha of Louisiana – [ ]  
Tulsa, University of, Beta of Oklahoma – Harrington Wells  
Union College, Alpha of New York – John Myers, IV  
Ursinus College, Tau of Pennsylvania – Lisa Tremper Hanover  
Utah, University of, Alpha of Utah – Floyd William Shiery, Jr.  
Valparaiso University, Epsilon of Indiana – James Caristi  
Vanderbilt University, Alpha of Tennessee – Edward H. Friedman  
Vassar College, Mu of New York – Lucille Lewis Johnson  
Vermont, University of, Alpha of Vermont – Zuell Philip Ambrose  
Villanova University, Sigma of Pennsylvania – Douglas Evatt Norton  
Virginia, University of, Beta of Virginia – Karlin Rae Luedtke  
Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Mu of Virginia – Bruce Evans Pencek; Sandra Eggert Birch  
Wabash College, Beta of Indiana – Robert Stockard Horton  
Wake Forest University, Delta of North Carolina – Brian William Tague  
Washington, University of, Alpha of Washington – Louise M. Richards  
Washington and Jefferson College, Kappa of Pennsylvania – Sam Gidas  
Washington and Lee University, Gamma of Virginia – Julie Campbell  
Washington State University, Gamma of Washington – Robert C. Ferguson  
Washington University, Beta of Missouri – Nancy P. Pope  
Wayne State University, Gamma of Michigan – Christopher D. Nazelli  
Wellesley College, Eta of Massachusetts – Wendy Hagen Bauer  
Wells College, Xi of New York – Deborah Ann Gagnon; Milene Morfei  
Wesleyan University, Gamma of Connecticut – [ ]  
Western Michigan University, Theta of Michigan – Matthew Scott Mingus, Ph.D.  
West Virginia University, Alpha of West Virginia – Alan Stolzenberg  
Wheaton College, Kappa of Massachusetts – Amy Margaret Cembor  
Whitman College, Beta of Washington – Andrea Dobson; Barry Allen Balof  
William and Mary, College of, Alpha of Virginia – Christopher Abelt; Sarah Lynne Stafford  
Willamette University, Delta of Oregon – Patricia Christine Alley  
Williams College, Nu of Pennsylvania – [ ]  
Wilson College, Nu of Pennsylvania – Wanda Finney  
Wisconsin, University of,  
    Madison, Alpha of Wisconsin – [ ]  
    Milwaukee, Eta of Wisconsin – Marjorie Bjornstad  
Wittenberg University, Omicron of Ohio – Stephanie Ann Little  
Wofford College, Beta of South Carolina – Timothy Eric Brown  
Wooster, College of, Kappa of Ohio – [ ]  
Wyoming, University of, Alpha of Wyoming – Eric W. Nye  
Yale College, Alpha of Connecticut – George Gilbert Levesque

*MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL*

**ASSOCIATION DELEGATES**

**Alabama**

Northeast Alabama Association, Gamma of Alabama – [ ]

**Arizona**

Phoenix Association, Alpha of Arizona – Marian Barchilon  
Tucson Area Association, Beta of Arizona – Donald Tempkin

**California**

Northern California Association, Gamma of California – Joanne Sandstrom  
San Diego Association, Epsilon of California – Tamara Shaw  
Southern California Association, Alpha of California – Anna Blount

**Colorado**

Denver Association, Alpha of Colorado – Barbara Berryman

**Connecticut**

Greater Hartford Association, Gamma of Connecticut – [ ]

**District of Columbia**

District of Columbia Association, Alpha of the District of Columbia – Valerie Neal; Katherine Tobin

**Florida**

Northeast Florida Association, Beta of Florida – Dale Clifford  
Palm Beach County Association, Zeta of Florida – Franklin Glickman  
Sarasota–Manatee Association, Epsilon of Florida – [ ]  
South Florida Association, Gamma of Florida – Abe Lavender  
Tampa Bay Association, Delta of Florida – Sandra Seckel; Alvin Wolfe

**Georgia**

Atlanta Association, Beta of Georgia – Linda Hubert  
Coastal Georgia–Carolina Association, Gamma of Georgia – James Anderson  
Middle Georgia PBK Alumni Association – Mary Alice Morgan

**Illinois**

Chicago Association, Alpha of Illinois – Judi Struss–Lipkin; Lorayne Dollet  
East Central Illinois Association, Gamma of Illinois – Bailey Young

**Indiana**

Eastern Indiana Association, Beta of Indiana – Jim Pyle  
Indianapolis Association, Alpha of Indiana – Rosalie Vermette; James Baldwin

**Kansas**

Greater Wichita Association, Alpha of Kansas – [ ]

**Kentucky**

Kentuckiana Association, Gamma of Kentucky – Judith Crutcher

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

**Louisiana**

Southwest Louisiana Association, Alpha of Louisiana – [ ]

**Maine**

Maine Association, Alpha of Maine – Carol O'Donnell

**Maryland**

Greater Baltimore Association, Alpha of Maryland – Murray Steinberg

**Massachusetts**

Boston Association, Alpha of Massachusetts – Margaret Lee

**Michigan**

Detroit Association, Beta of Michigan – Kathy Malloy; Mindy Hitchcock

Southwest Michigan Association, Alpha of Michigan – Paul Pancella

**Missouri**

Metropolitan St. Louis Association, Alpha of Missouri – [ ]

Northeastern Missouri Association, Beta of Missouri – Dereck Daschke

**Nebraska**

Omaha Association, Alpha of Nebraska – Jenni Schlossman

**New Mexico**

Los Alamos Association, Alpha of New Mexico – [ ]

**New York**

New York Association, Alpha of New York – Demetrios Melis

Scarsdale/Westchester/Fairfield Association, Eta of New York – Muriel Aylin Kurtoglu

Upper Hudson Association, Beta of New York – Gloria Karin

Western New York Association, Iota of New York – Patricia Randolph

**North Carolina**

Central Carolinas, Gamma of North Carolina – Mark Alan Canada

Pitt County Association, Beta of North Carolina – [ ]

Wake County Association, Alpha of North Carolina – [ ]

**Ohio**

Cleveland Association, Beta of Ohio – Elizabeth Swenson

Toledo Area Association, Alpha of Ohio – Benjamin Pryor

**Oklahoma**

Oklahoma City Association, Alpha of Oklahoma – [ ]

**Pennsylvania**

Delaware Valley Association, Gamma of Pennsylvania – Joseph Poluka; Margaret Wendling

Pittsburgh Association, Delta of Pennsylvania – Stephen Houghton

*MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL*

**South Carolina**

Lowcountry Association, Beta of South Carolina – Ami McCandless

**Tennessee**

Chattanooga Association, Gamma of Tennessee – Chuck Lippy

Nashville Association, Delta of Tennessee – Mimi Klein

**Texas**

Austin Association, Zeta of Texas – Carol MacKay

Greater Houston Association, Delta of Texas – Charles Caldwell

North Texas Association, Beta of Texas – [ ]

San Antonio Association, Epsilon of Texas – Inga Cotton

West Texas and Eastern New Mexico Association – Edward Quitevis

**Virginia**

Richmond Association, Alpha of Virginia – Ellen Massie

Shenandoah Valley Association, Beta of Virginia – Charles Blake

**Washington**

Inland Empire Association, Beta of Washington – Robbie McMillian

Puget Sound Association of PBK, Alpha of Washington – Daniel Leach; Katherine Ostrom

**Wisconsin**

Greater Milwaukee Association of PBK, Alpha of Wisconsin – Scott Enk

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

**DISTRICT OFFICERS**

**New England District**

(Connecticut, Maine, Massachusetts, New Hampshire, Rhode Island, Vermont)

Katherine Soule, Chair  
Carol O'Donnell, Secretary

**Middle Atlantic District**

(Delaware, New Jersey, New York, Pennsylvania)

C. Howard Krukofsky, Chair  
Theopolis Fair, Vice Chair  
Vera L. Junkers, Secretary-Treasurer

**East Central District**

(Illinois, Indiana, Michigan, Ohio)

Gregory G. Gocek, Vice Chair

**North Central District**

(Iowa, Kansas, Minnesota, Missouri, Nebraska, North Dakota, South Dakota, Wisconsin)

Carol Race, Chair  
Judith Lynn Sebesta, Secretary

**South Atlantic District**

(District of Columbia, Florida, Georgia, Maryland, North Carolina, South Carolina, Virginia, West Virginia)

James Lightner, Chair  
Hilda C. Fisher, Vice Chair  
Sandra Birch, Secretary-Treasurer

**South Central District**

(Alabama, Arkansas, Kentucky, Louisiana, Mississippi, Oklahoma, Tennessee, Texas)

Mary Meredith, Secretary

**Western District**

(Alaska, Arizona, California, Colorado, Hawaii, Idaho, Montana, Nevada, New Mexico, Oregon, Utah, Washington, Wyoming)

Bette Napoli Harris, Chair  
Jean Paule, Secretary-Treasurer

*MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL*

**ASSOCIATION CONFERENCE OFFICERS**

Michael Gauger, Secretary

**COMMITTEE ON QUALIFICATIONS**

Catherine White Berheide  
Leslie G. Butler  
Eloise Clark  
Andrea Kay Dobson  
Joseph W. Gordon  
Alonzo Hamby

C. Scott Littleton  
Paul Lukacs  
Karen Hancock Nelson  
Lynn C. Pasquerella  
Mary Jo Richardson  
Don J. Wyatt

**COUNCIL NOMINATING COMMITTEE**

Neil Harris, Chair  
Frederick J. Crosson  
David W. Hart

Judith Sebesta  
Bonnie Wheeler

**VISITING SCHOLAR CELEBRATION PARTICIPANT**

Helen F. North, Chair  
Werner L. Gundersheimer, Former Chair  
Linda Greenhouse

N. Katherine Hayles  
Dennis O'Brien  
Yi-Fu Tuan

**PARLIAMENTARIAN**

Clare Page Cabey

**FELLOWS**

Murray Drabkin, President of the Fellows

William W. Kelly  
Harry V. Lamon  
Jonathan E. Lewis

Michael F. Lubin  
Steven F. Unti  
Manning M. Pattillo

**GUESTS**

Hazel E. Barnes, Former Chair  
Chip DeMatteo, Hand and Hammer  
Gerald Early, Distinguished Service Recipient  
Eddie Eitches, South Atlantic District Senate Nominee

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

Ralph Hexter, Council Nominating Committee Nominee  
Frances Robb, Former Visiting Scholar Program Administrator  
Anya Royce, Visiting Scholar Committee Member  
William Reinhardt, Council Nominating Committee Nominee  
Charles H. Tilly, Sidney Hook Recipient

**APPLICANT CHAPTER ATTENDEES**

Christopher Ames, Washington College  
Thomas C. Black, Washington College  
Gregg E. Camfield, University of the Pacific  
Nancy Freudenthal, The College of New Jersey  
Philip Gilbertson, University of the Pacific  
Stanley E. Hedeem, Xavier University  
Jens Holley, Clemson University  
Mary Jane Hurst, Texas Tech University  
Bridget M. Keegan, Creighton University  
Baird Tipson, Jr., Washington College  
David F. Ventura, The College of New Jersey  
James Wunsch, Creighton University

**OTHER ATTENDEES**

Leslie E. Bauman, Mississippi State University  
Stephen M. Berman, Atlanta Association  
Samuel C. Dudley, Jr., Society Member  
Russell B. Gill, Elon University  
Sherrie Lynn Ford, Society Member  
Marlin R. Gottschalk, Atlanta Association  
Randy Harshbarger, Middle Georgia Association  
Clarence R. Lassetter, Society Member  
Leann F. Logsdon, Atlanta Association  
Rebecca E. Martin, Pace University  
Thomas W. Polaski, Winthrop University  
George Pruden, Coastal Georgia-Carolina Association  
Ronnie Silett, Coastal Georgia-Carolina Association  
Helen F. Walton, Elon University  
Sonya F. Weiner, Society Member  
Robert M. West, Society Member

## *MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL*

### **FIRST PLENARY SESSION**

October 27, 2006

1. The Council convened for its first plenary session on Friday, October 27, at 9:00 a.m. in the Peachtree Ballroom of the Atlanta Westin Peachtree Plaza Hotel. President Niall Slater greeted the delegates and expressed thanks to Ms. Cameron Curtis, Director of Phi Beta Kappa Society Affairs, who coordinated the planning for the Council meetings, with the help of her colleagues in the national office. He also thanked Agnes Scott College, the Georgia Carolina Alumni Association, Emory University, the University of Georgia, the Metropolitan Atlanta Alumni Association, the Middle Georgia Alumni Association, Morehouse College, and Spelman College for their contributions to the planning and support of the delegates' reception the previous evening and for their assistance with Council registration.

2. After polling the delegates regarding their attendance at past Councils, and welcoming the many who indicated they were attending for the first time, President Slater recognized the representatives from several colleges and universities seeking to establish new Phi Beta Kappa chapters. He offered special greetings to the immediate past president of the Society, Joseph Gordon, as well as to past president Frederick Crosson. He also extended special greetings to former Society Secretaries Kenneth Greene, who served from 1975 to 1991, and Douglas Foard, who served from 1991 to 2001, and to Murray Drabkin, President of the Phi Beta Kappa Fellows, noting that this organization has sustained the Phi Beta Kappa Foundation since 1940 with cumulative contributions in excess of \$2 million.

3. The President introduced the other persons on the rostrum: John Churchill, Society Secretary since 2001, and Clara Paige Cabey, who was serving as Council Parliamentarian.

4. President Slater explained that the 41<sup>st</sup> Council deliberations would be assisted by four committees composed primarily of delegates. He introduced them by naming their chairs and thanking the members in advance for their efforts on the Council's behalf. Those committees were:

#### Committee on Credentials

James E. Lightner (McDaniel College), Chair

Valerie Neal (D.C. Association)

Joseph Poluka (Delaware Valley Association)

#### Tellers

Eric Nye (University of Wyoming), Chair

Judith Crutcher (Kentuckiana Association)

David Darst (University of Florida)

Andrea Dobson (Whitman College)

Hilda Fisher (Goucher College)

Mark Hasegawa Johnson (University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign)

Charles Lippy (Chattanooga Association)

Marjorie Munson (Douglass College, Rutgers University)

Britt Anne Murphy (Hendrix College)

Katherine Ostrom (Puget Sound Association)

Donald Tempkin (Tucson Association)

Rosalie Vermette (Indianapolis Association)

#### Council Finance Committee

Douglas McCabe (Georgetown University), Chair

John Page, Society Treasurer

Kay Fiset (Syracuse University)



*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

Judi Lipkin (Chicago Association)  
Calvin Niewall (Coe College)

Committee on Resolutions

Kathleen French (University of California–San Diego), Chair  
Barbara Carter (Spelman College)  
Joe Fugate (Kalamazoo College)  
Demetrios Melis (New York Association)  
Mary Alice Morgan (Middle Georgia Association)

5. President Slater then gave his report of the last triennium, noting briefly the work of the Senate, which consists of 24 elected members which meet twice yearly and an executive committee which meets quarterly. He apologized for the omission of Senator Fred Cate's name from the listing of the executive committee on page 28 of the Delegates Manual. He observed that the Senate worked much harder and was more deeply engaged in the work of the Society than when he first joined it twelve years before. The president also noted that he had had the privilege of representing the Society at a number of events throughout the triennium including the installations of chapters at Roanoke College, Valparaiso University, and Texas A&M University. He concluded his remarks with words of thanks for the work of Secretary Churchill, Associate Secretary Scott Lurding, and Treasurer John Page, and called upon the secretary for his report.

6. Secretary Churchill began by saying that "things are well, and they are improving," noting that the Society exists in an environment marked by profound changes. While the values of Phi Beta Kappa have not changed, the world of higher education has, and the Society must engage the environment we are in, looking to the future and not the past. Many students and faculty do not understand Phi Beta Kappa's role as an advocate for the liberal arts and sciences, so it is the Society's job to make this role unmistakable, increasing its visibility and effectiveness. The Society has become increasingly visible in regional and national publications, associations, and conferences. With support from the Mellon Foundation, a program designed on the Visiting Scholar Program model has been extended to historically Black and Hispanic campuses, and with help from the Teagle Foundation Phi Beta Kappa is exploring the teaching and learning of deliberation on a dozen other campuses. If the Society succeeds in cultivating persons of deliberation and reflection, no one will ever ask whether Phi Beta Kappa matters.

7. The Secretary went on to note the sound financial management of the Society, three fundraising efforts underway, and the implementation of the Society's strategic plan. He noted the work of the Committee on Chapters, chaired by Senator Harvey Klehr, to assist those chapters where member acceptance rates are low and praised the work of staff member Patrick Farmer, who had been making visits to chapters across the country with positive results. He commented favorably on the Visiting Scholar Program, chaired by former Senator Helen North and coordinated so successfully by Kathy Navascues; the work of the Committee on Associations chaired by Senator Judith Krug, the Conference of Association Delegates chaired by Barbara Marmorstein, and staff member Cara Engel. He praised the work of the Committee on Qualifications, chaired by Senator Catherine Berheide; the Publications Committee, chaired by Senator Alonzo Hamby, as well as the work of Editors Robert Wilson of the *American Scholar* and Kelly Gerald of the *Key Reporter*; and the Information Technology Committee, chaired by Senator Kurt Olsson. He concluded his remarks by thanking all of the members of the staff of the Washington office for their skills and dedication to the work of the Society, and noted that it was an honor and great joy to represent Phi Beta Kappa and to advance its work.

8. President Slater then called for a report from the Committee on Qualifications and from the Credentials Committee, but neither was available. He moved on to ask for additions or corrections to the minutes of the 40<sup>th</sup> Triennial Council that had been published in the Council Bulletin and posted on the

## *MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL*

Society's Web site. There was no objection and he declared the minutes approved. He reminded the delegates of the deadline for submission of resolutions to the Resolutions Committee and commented on the procedure for submitting motions to amend the Constitution and Bylaws. He then called on the chief teller to explain the council voting procedures.

9. Chief Teller Eric Nye called the delegates' attention to pages 16 - 18 of the Delegates Manual which described the two different styles of ballots to be employed during the voting: individual ballots and delegation ballots. He encouraged the delegates to study the Manual and to be prepared to vote expeditiously.

10. After a short break, President Slater reconvened the Council and introduced and welcomed the Mayor of Atlanta, Shirley Franklin, to the podium. Mayor Franklin welcomed the Council to Atlanta, expressed appreciation for the much-needed rain which was dampening our visit, and spoke about the advances in education and literacy in Atlanta.

11. President Slater thanked Mayor Franklin for her remarks and commented that his mother runs one of the "One Book-One Community" programs in Atlanta.

12. James Lightner, Chair of the Credentials Committee, then reported that, at that moment, 238 delegates representing 211 chapters and 45 delegates representing 41 associations were registered. Eighteen senators, three of whom were also delegates, and two past presidents were also registered and entitled to vote. Hence the total voting body at this juncture was 272, representing 252 different units. In addition, there were 46 non-voting members (alternates and guests) registered, bringing the total registration for the Council to 318. Two more reports would be given and these numbers were expected to rise with each report.

13. President Slater then introduced Catherine White Berheide, Chair of the Committee on Qualifications, who briefly reviewed the committee process that brought the six recommended institutions to the Council for consideration. She referred several times to the Delegates Manual beginning on page 64, and asked that any specific question about an institution be submitted no later than 12:45 p.m. that day, so that it could be answered during the second plenary session when each of the institutions would be formally presented for vote. She described the initial application, the comprehensive report, the site visit, and the committee and Senate approval process. She noted that the process operates on a continuous three-year cycle, with the Council vote ending one cycle and the next beginning on November 1. She encouraged the delegates to read carefully the detailed statements on the six nominated chapters in preparation for the presentations and discussion which would occur that afternoon.

14. The President called on former Senator Neil Harris, Chair of the Council Nominating Committee, to present the slate of nominees for officers and Senators. Professor Harris thanked those who had served with him: Fredrick Crosson, Claire Gaudiani, David Hart, Linda Kerber, David Lewis, Judith Sebesta, and Bonnie Wheeler. He then presented the name of Judith Krug as the nominee for Society Vice President. Senator Krug stood and was recognized. President Slater called for additional nominations and, hearing none, entertained a motion to accept the nomination by acclamation. The vote was unanimous.

15. Chairman Harris then placed into nomination the name of Allison Blakely for Society President. Senator Blakely stood and was recognized. The President called for additional nominations and, hearing none, again entertained a motion to accept the nomination by acclamation. The vote was again unanimous.

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

16. Following the nominations process, President Slater called for a rising vote of all official delegates, in favor of the election of Senator Krug as Vice President and Senator Blakely as President. The delegates rose in unanimity and the Senators were declared elected to their respective positions.

17. President Slater then called upon Senator Harvey Klehr, chair of the Committee on Chapters, who presented Outstanding Chapter Awards, each consisting of a plaque and a check for \$1000, to: Liberal Arts College—Elmira College, Pi of New York; Public University— University of North Carolina at Greensboro, Epsilon of North Carolina; and Private University— New York University, Beta of New York. Each award-winning chapter was lauded for its diversified campus program and projects, visibility, initiation rate, and timely submission of reports.

18. The President then called upon Senator Judith Krug, chair of the Committee on Associations, who presented outstanding association awards, each consisting of a plaque and a check for \$1000, to: Association with fewer than 100 members—Phoenix Association; Association with 101-300 members—Colorado Denver Association; Association with more 300 members—Greater Houston Association. Each association awardee was lauded for its special events, projects, outreach, and timely submission of reports.

19. After clarifying that the number of open seats for the Senate, as a result of the officer election, was now reduced by two, President Slater encouraged the delegates to congratulate those chapters and associations recently awarded for their good work and adjourned the first plenary session at 11:30 a.m.

*MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL*

**SMALL-GROUP SESSIONS**

**GROUP DISCUSSIONS**

**FRIDAY, October 27**

**First Session: Group Discussions**

**11:45 a.m.-12:45 p.m.**

**A. Best Practices for Associations**

*Hear from the 2006 Award-Winning Associations*

Doug Foard, Moderator

Ellyn Stein, Phoenix Association

Charles Caldwell, Houston Association

Barbara Berryman, Denver Association

**B. Where to Turn: How to find a receptive audience for your best ideas**

*The editor of The American Scholar and several contributors to the magazine talk about the challenges facing writers and scholars who are looking for serious general readers of their work*

Robert Wilson, Moderator

Emily Bernard, Adam Goodheart, Thomas Mallon

**C. Top of the Class: Chapter Visibility on Campus**

*Chapter Officers talk about junior-year induction, collaborating with the campus Honors College and other chapter activities*

Joseph Gordon, Moderator, Yale University

Kathy Olmstead, University of Maine

Bonnie Wheeler, Southern Methodist University

Todd Breyfogle, University of Denver

**D. National Study on Liberal Arts Education**

*Charles Blaich, Director of the Center for Inquiry at Wabash College, talks about a study produced by the center*

**E. Future Initiatives for The Phi Beta Kappa Society**

*Discuss the future of Phi Beta Kappa with Secretary John Churchill*

**SATURDAY, October 28**

**Second Session: Group Discussions**

**8:30-9:30 a.m.**

**A. Tips from Award-Winning Chapters**

*Hear from the 2006 Award-Winning Chapters*

Doug Foard, Moderator

Alec Haddy, University of North Carolina-Greensboro

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

John Delgrosso, New York University  
Frederick Schult, New York University  
Margaret Arnesen, Elmira College

**B. Public Understanding of Science in the Liberal Arts Curriculum**

*Jon Miller, Professor of Biology and Preventive Medicine at Northwestern University and Director of the Center for Biomedical Communication, discusses how public understanding of science relates to the liberal arts curriculum*

**C. Fundraising for Associations**

*Successful fundraising examples for small and large associations*

Theopolis Fair, Moderator

Charles Caldwell, Houston Association

Joanne Sandstrom, Northern California Association

**D. Future Initiatives for The Phi Beta Kappa Society**

*Discuss the future of Phi Beta Kappa with Secretary John Churchill*

## *MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL*

### **SECOND PLENARY SESSION**

October 27, 2006

20. The second plenary session was called to order by President Slater at 2:45 p.m. He called on Joseph Poluka of the Committee on Credentials for the second report of that committee. At that point, there were registered 253 delegates representing 217 chapters and 49 delegates representing 45 associations. There were also 21 senators, six of whom were also delegates, for a total of 15 voting senators, giving a total of 317 voting members, representing 262 constituent groups. The remaining 72 non-voting members brought the total attendants to 389.

21. President Slater called upon Senator Catherine Berheide (Skidmore College) for the second part of her report of the Committee on Qualifications. She was joined on the dais by the other committee members, whom she introduced: Eloise Clark (Bowling Green State University), Leslie G. Butler (Louisiana State University), Andrea Dobson (Whitman College), Joseph W. Gordon (Yale University), Alonzo Hamby (Ohio University), C. Scott Littleton (Occidental College), Paul Lukacs (Loyola College in Maryland), Karen Nelson (Austin College), Lynn Pasquerella (University of Rhode Island), Mary Jo Richardson (Texas A&M University), and Don J. Wyatt (Middlebury College). She then responded to a set of general procedural questions that had been posed by the delegates. She reported that the committee had received about 40 applications during the triennium from which six emerged for Council consideration. The list of unsuccessful applicants is not published nor are the reasons why an institution is not put forward for final vote. However, the committee and staff members do discuss with the applicant institutions the areas of concern which have been raised during the review process with a goal to improving the institution and perhaps leading to a subsequent reapplication. She commented that the application for a chapter is made by the resident Phi Beta Kappa faculty members, and it is to them that the charter is eventually granted, not the sheltering institution. The number of tenured Phi Beta Kappas in the liberal arts is considered, to assure stability and continuity for the prospective chapter. The reviewers also look for a critical mass of Phi Beta Kappa-caliber students, either through highly selective admissions or in an honors college. Enrollment of these students in mathematics and languages is also examined. Graduation rates are examined, especially in the liberal arts areas. The Committee also seeks to ensure that the policies and practices of the institution support the strength of the liberal arts. Athletic policies and procedures are also examined, including scholarships and any NCAA sanctions. She concluded by noting that the three-year review process is very wide-ranging and intensive, as the reports for the individual institutions being presented during this session would indicate. Committee members who chaired visiting teams then reported to the Council on their site visits to the six campuses that were recommended for favorable action (described in detail in the Manual, pp. 67-120). In each case, the chair of the visiting team discussed what the team had found, and invited team colleagues to add their remarks. Also addressed were questions that delegates had submitted before the presentation.

22. Senator Eloise Clark presented a summary of the application from Clemson University. Senator Don Wyatt chaired the visit to the College of New Jersey. Professor Karen Nelson presented the University of the Pacific, followed by Senator Joseph Gordon, who had chaired the visit to Texas Tech University. Professor Leslie Butler reported on Washington College, and Senator Alonzo Hamby presented a summary of the visit to Xavier University.

23. President Slater thanked Committee Chair Berheide and the Committee on Qualifications for the tremendous amount of work over the past triennium in bringing the six institutions recommended for Phi Beta Kappa charters to the Council and declared the floor open for discussion of the motion to approve the recommendations. He invited delegates who wished to speak first to the portion of the motion dealing with Clemson University to come forward to the microphones. There were no questions, and so he moved on to the College of New Jersey. William Beardsley of the University of Puget Sound asked about the number of volumes in the library, and the visiting team agreed to search out the figure. (This was

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

ultimately reported by Senator Wyatt to be 550,000 volumes, including monographs and periodicals.) There being no further questions about the College of New Jersey, the President called for comments or questions about the University of the Pacific. Dan Snell of the University of Oklahoma asked about a three-year B.A. program that had been reported, and Professor Butler responded that the program no longer existed. The recommendation on Texas Tech University elicited no questions and so the President moved on to Washington College. Jules Gleicher of Rockford College raised the question of the use of adjuncts at both Washington and Xavier, especially as instructors in freshman seminars. He felt that such a required part of the curriculum, an introduction to the liberal arts, should not be assigned to part-time instructors. The response was delayed by the President so that other questions relating only to Washington College could be expressed. Wayne Steinmetz of Pomona College was concerned that the NMR Spectrometer was temporarily in storage while the science facility was being renovated. Professor Butler, himself a chemist, responded that he was impressed with how Washington had carefully accommodated the temporary problem. Rich Butler of Trinity University in San Antonio expressed a concern over the relatively small number of PBK key holders on campus and sought assurance that the chapter at Washington could sustain itself. Chair Berheide responded that this is often a concern with smaller institutions but that it rarely was a problem because each local chapter depends upon a small number of dedicated workers who keep things moving, and a long list of key holders does not necessarily assure an active chapter. Curtis Clark of Morehouse College was concerned about the quantitative requirement being met in a number of non-mathematical ways including music and wondered about its implementation. Chair Berheide noted that regardless of the college quantitative requirement, candidates for Phi Beta Kappa would have to choose mathematics to meet the Society stipulations.

24. This comment stimulated a general question concerning how the Society scrutinizes the behavior of the local chapters regarding the stipulations. Chair Berheide responded that this had long been an issue within the Society and the Committee on Qualifications and was partially the impetus for the creation of the Committee on Chapters nine years ago. That committee has stepped up efforts to evaluate the activities and procedures of the local chapters, and the new chapters will be instructed in the rules and procedures of member selection. Jay Freyman of the University of Maryland, Baltimore County, reiterated the issue of the number of key holders at Washington College and assured the delegates that the other seven chapters in Maryland would be happy to lend support and guidance to the new chapter. There being no further comments about Washington College, President Slater then turned to Xavier University, and Frank Eakin of the University of Richmond raised a question about required senior theses for all students except those in theology. Senator Hamby agreed to search out that answer but replied to the earlier question about the use of adjunct instructors. He reported that freshmen seminars are not taught by adjuncts but that freshman composition courses did employ adjuncts, which is often the case in many institutions. Ann Larimore of the University of Michigan asked whether the Xavier core curriculum included two theology courses and, if so, what those courses entailed. Senator Hamby responded that the core did include two such courses, and read from the catalog a list of all the theology courses that seemed to clarify that these were quite diversified and ecumenical. Nancy Pope, an adjunct instructor at the Washington University in St. Louis, commented that the number of adjuncts and what they teach is not necessarily the only way to measure these faculty appointments. The real issue, she felt, was the quality and preparation of the adjunct instructors as well as the exploitation of those with Ph.D.s. An unidentified speaker spoke in agreement with this viewpoint.

25. Seeing no more delegates wishing to speak to one or more of the institutions, President Slater called upon Chief Teller Eric Nye to explain the procedure for voting on the six proposed chapters, which would be a delegation vote, with possible fractions. He also noted that abstentions would count as negative votes. The delegation ballots were then cast, and they were received by the tellers.

26. President Slater called back to the podium the Chair of the Nominating Committee, Neil Harris, for the remaining parts of his report. He then placed into nomination the candidates for Senators-at-Large:

## MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL

Danielle S. Allen, Catherine White Berheide, John Peter Birkelund, Arline L. Bronzaft, Joseph W. Gordon, Anthony Grafton, Jonathan E. Lewis, Paul Lukacs, Demetrios G. Melis, Joseph G. Poluka, Katherine R. Soule, and Richard P. Thornell. These candidates were asked to come forward so that the delegates could identify them. Biographies of the candidates appeared on pp. 50-56 of the Manual. Nominees for District Senators, who had been nominated by the districts rather than the nominating committee, were then presented: South Central District: Charles H. Adams and Susan K. Hagen; New England District: Lisa H. Newton and Don J. Wyatt; South Atlantic District: Edward Eitches and James E. Lightner. These candidates were also asked to come forward to be identified. Biographies of these candidates appeared on pp. 56-59 of the Manual. Finally, the candidates for the Council Nominating Committee were presented and those present came forward to be introduced: Former Senators: Joan M. Ferrante, Gerald L. Alexanderson, Werner Gundersheimer, and Robert L. Patten; Non-Senators: Linn Donaldson, Ralph Hexter, William P. Reinhardt, and Steven F. Unti. Biographies of these nominees appeared on pp. 59-63 of the Manual.

27. President Slater then asked for further nominations from the floor for Senator-at-Large or Council Nominating Committee, but hearing none, he entertained a motion to accept the report of the nominating committee which was seconded and approved by voice vote. The Council then proceeded to the balloting for Senators-at-Large (six for a six-year term and one for a three-year term to complete an unexpired term), District Senators, and Council Nominating Committee. The process of voting was again explained by the Chief Teller.

28. The voting having been completed, President Slater announced the Council Symposium and Reception in the Carter Center beginning at 6:30 p.m. The symposium would feature lectures by three recent Visiting Scholars from the humanities and from the social and behavioral sciences. Completing the Visiting Scholar celebration would be a lecture the following morning by Linda Greenhouse, *New York Times* Supreme Court correspondent. There being no further business, the second plenary session was adjourned.



*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

**THIRD PLENARY SESSION**  
October 28, 2006

29. The third plenary session of the Council was called to order by President Slater at 1:00 p.m. The first order of business was the final report of the Credentials Committee, which was given by its chair, James Lightner. He reported that 257 delegates representing 221 chapters and 50 delegates representing 46 associations were registered for the Council. Twenty-one senators, six of whom were delegates, and two past presidents, one of whom was a delegate, brought the total voting membership to 323, representing 267 Phi Beta Kappa units. In addition there were 81 non-voting guests, alternates, staff, and visitors, making a total registration of 404 for the 41<sup>st</sup> Council. The President expressed his appreciation for the efforts of the committee.

30. President Slater then invited the Chief Teller, Eric Nye, to the podium to report on the results of the preceding day's balloting. Professor Nye reported that all six of the recommended chapters had received the necessary votes to become chartered; this report was greeted with a round of applause from the delegates. He then reported that the following were elected Senators-at-Large for six-year terms: Danielle S. Allen, Catherine White Berheide, Joseph W. Gordon, Anthony Grafton, Paul Lukacs, and Katherine R. Soule. Arline L. Bronzaft was elected Senator for the three-year unexpired term. Elected District Senators were: Susan K. Hagen (South Central District), Don J. Wyatt (New England District), and James E. Lightner (South Atlantic District). The Council Nominating Committee for 2006-2009 would consist of former Senators Joan M. Ferrante and Werner Gundersheimer and non-Senators Ralph Hexter and William P. Reinhardt. The President thanked Professor Nye and the tellers for their excellent work in tallying the many ballots.

31. At this point President Slater expressed his gratitude for the opportunity to serve as president during the past triennium and his personal thanks to all with whom he had been privileged to work. At the conclusion of his remarks he invited the newly elected president, Allison Blakely, to the podium and formally handed over the gavel and office. President Blakely in turn expressed his personal thanks and the appreciation of the Society for Past President Slater's strong and effective leadership (his style was described as unflappable) over the past triennium, and the delegates responded with warm and extended applause.

32. President Blakely then made some comments regarding the next triennium. He described the Society as being rich and vibrant, both materially and in human resources, at the national and local levels. He looked forward to working with Vice President Krug, who would keep the Society focused on the special concerns of the associations. He promised to build upon the strengths already in place and to continue to assist worthy projects already underway. He also pledged to work toward a change in the Society's sense of identity, to become an organization that holds high values but also advocates for those values publicly. He expressed the hope that new initiates would enter the Society with a sense of belonging to Phi Beta Kappa, not just having been honored by Phi Beta Kappa. He concluded his remarks by soliciting ideas and seeking improved communication within the Society and its members.

33. Following his remarks, President Blakely called attention to Article X, section 3, of the Phi Beta Kappa Constitution, which specifies that there must be a Council Finance Committee, empowered to examine the treasurer's report, the budget, and all financial matters to be considered by the Council. Douglas McCabe of Georgetown University chaired that committee and he was invited to the podium for his report.

34. Professor McCabe began by thanking the other members of his committee and noted that the committee is advisory to the Society Secretary. He then reported that the committee had analyzed the audited FY2004 and FY2005 consolidated financial statements as well as the FY2006 results with various

## *MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL*

monthly consolidated reports through June 2006. They found that the income statements and balance sheets were reasonable, respectable, and appropriate for a nonprofit organization. Revenues for the Society were in the stable range, spending was stable and predictable, and the financial statements appeared to be those of a solvent, stable, and well-managed enterprise. He also commented that the asset allocation, policies, and performance of the Phi Beta Kappa Foundation were reasonable and well-monitored. He applauded the national office for its strategic plan to increase annual giving to the Society and to allocate the Society's resources through informed financial management. He concluded by saying, "The overall financial position of the Society and the Foundation is good."

35. President Blakely thanked Professor McCabe for the committee's thorough work and then called upon the chair of the Committee on Resolutions, Kathleen French, for her report. Professor French began her report by thanking her committee members for their early-morning work to prepare the resolutions which had been prepared as a handout for the delegates as they entered the third plenary session. She noted that Resolution 1 thanked the many people who assisted with the planning and functioning of the Council meeting. It also recognized those leaving the Senate or other offices, congratulated those chapters and associations celebrating 50<sup>th</sup>, 100<sup>th</sup>, 150<sup>th</sup>, and 200<sup>th</sup> year anniversaries, and recognized officers of chapters and associations serving ten or more years in office. President Blakely asked for a vote of acceptance of the resolution by acclamation, and it was quickly forthcoming.

36. Resolutions Chair French then presented the second proposed resolution:

Resolved: That this 41<sup>st</sup> Triennial Council of the Phi Beta Kappa Society authorize and instruct the national office to promulgate and promote the following statement of the Society's conviction concerning the importance of excellence in the liberal arts and sciences in American higher education:

The United States Secretary of Education's Commission on the Future of Higher Education has issued, in September 2006, a report seriously flawed by omission of the role of the liberal arts and sciences in sustaining the excellence of American higher education.

Since 1776, the Phi Beta Kappa Society has upheld the conviction that broad undergraduate study in the liberal arts and sciences, conducted with rigor, is essential to the accomplishment of higher education's most important purposes. Many members of Phi Beta Kappa have gone on to serve as the nation's most eminent leaders in government, the private sector, and academe. Education in the liberal arts and sciences has molded and fortified them for their contributions to the nation.

The transformative and empowering consequences of higher education depend upon strong student engagement with the liberal arts and sciences. The Phi Beta Kappa Society, therefore, urges the nation's higher education leadership, in pursuing appropriate goals of increased access, affordability, and accountability, to advance these studies as the keystone of excellence in American higher education.

President Blakely then read the rules of debate which were operative at Council meetings. Each speech would be limited to ten minutes. No member would be permitted to speak a second time on an item as long as another is requesting to speak for the first time. With these rules in place he invited delegates to come forward to the microphones.

Stephen Miller of the University of the South thanked the Committee on Resolutions for the resolution, noting that it addressed the recently published Spellings Report, which dealt with praiseworthy ventures like accountability and accessibility, but he felt that there were some troubling implications of the report as well. He pointed out that the commission creating the report was composed primarily of business and

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

industry people and that the one member from the American Council on Education, David Ward, had not signed the report. He supported a pro-active stance by the Society in support of the liberal arts. William Stuart of the University of Maryland also strongly supported the resolution, recalling the National Defense Education Act of the 1960s that had supported the liberal arts and regretting that this report did not. An unidentified speaker raised a question of whether the national office, promulgating the sense of the resolution, would be bound by its exact wording. Ms. French responded that it was her opinion that the national office would have latitude in the wording and not be strictly held to the words of the resolution. "That was what I wanted to hear," the questioner replied. Eric Griffin of Millsaps College was also troubled by the language of the resolution, feeling that it was too nationalistic. Jules Gleicher of Rockford College proposed an amendment to the resolution, to strike the second paragraph, which would make the statement more positive in tone. President Blakely suggested that a vote by show of hands might be in order. A call for debate on the amendment yielded a comment from Todd Breyfogle of the University of Denver, who inquired whether the amendment was necessary at all, given the latitude being given to the national office to determine specific wording. President Blakely ruled that because the amendment would make a substantive change in the resolution, it should be considered and voted upon. James Christy of Valparaiso University rose to speak against the amendment, feeling that the resolution was much more powerful with the second paragraph intact. Stephen Miller of the University of the South spoke against the amendment because the Spellings Report had been authored by the chair of the "No Child Left Behind" commission, Charles Miller, and the Spellings Report also emphasizes testing and professional training, just as they are in the earlier report. He felt that if the implications were realized it could be damaging to the free pursuit of ideas in higher education. As the discussion continued, Malcolm Sherman of SUNY Albany commented that he did not feel comfortable taking a critical stand on the Spellings Report. At this point, President Blakely entertained a motion to close debate that passed on a voice vote. He then asked for a vote on the amendment, to strike the second paragraph of the resolution. The amendment failed, by a vote of 39 for and 176 against. John Myers of Union College proposed an amendment to change the first paragraph to read: "That this 41<sup>st</sup> Triennial Council of the Phi Beta Kappa Society authorize and instruct the national office to promulgate and promote a statement of the Society's conviction concerning the importance of the excellence in the liberal arts and sciences in American higher education to the effect that:" After some discussion on parliamentary procedure, President Blakely called for a voice vote on the amendment which resulted in the amendment passing. He then called for a vote on the amended resolution by a show of hands. This vote resulted in the amended resolution being approved by a wide margin.

37. Ms. French then moved on to Resolution 3, a proposed change in ByLaw 6, item 5 (found on p. 131 of the Manual). [Additions are shown using underlined text.]

A chair, a vice chair, and a secretary for the accredited associations shall be elected to serve for three years by the association delegates at the triennial Council. The chair and the secretary shall be authorized to attend and speak at all meetings of the Senate. In any case where either the chair or secretary is unable to attend any meeting of the Senate, the vice chair shall be authorized to attend and speak at that meeting.

The author of the resolution, Anna Blount of the Southern California Association, spoke to the reason for the resolution, to assure that the associations would always have two representatives at Senate meetings. President Blakely asked for any comments in opposition to the resolution. Niall Slater, past president, commented that the bylaw change did not provide for executive sessions of the Senate, which only Senators are legally entitled to attend. Ms. Blount responded that the resolution was not an attempt to attend meetings where the representatives were not permitted, and agreed to change the language to meet the current regulations. Jules Gleicher of Rockford College noted that the effect of the resolution was to allow the vice chair of the associations a presence when one of the two other officers could not attend. Wayne Steinmetz of Pomona College commented that the language of the resolution speaks to all

## *MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL*

associations and seemed to be cumbersome, unnecessary, and a vote of no confidence in the Senate. Scott Enk of the Greater Milwaukee Association spoke in favor of the resolution and reiterated the reasoning for the change. He also spoke about the significance of the associations and their membership. The current Conference of Association Delegates vice chair, Scott Littleton of the Western District, noted the problem that he had not attended the Senate meetings during the triennium when Conference Chair Barbara Marmorstein had been unable to do so, and this hampered his ability to preside at the Conference meetings at the Council. He noted that this change would not impose any additional cost on the Society. Linda Hubert of the Atlanta Association proposed a friendly amendment to clarify wording: "A chair, a vice chair, and a secretary from the Conference of Association Delegates" to replace the wording about accredited associations. This amendment was accepted by the proposer. Ms. French suggested a minor change in the last sentence: "a meeting of the Senate" rather than "any meeting." A vote by show of hands resulted in the amendment passing. Jill Van Newenhizen of Lake Forest College questioned where in Bylaw 6 the association officers were given the right to attend Senate meetings and to speak, and Ms. French noted that this had been raised in the committee. The bylaw does not explicitly provide for this attendance but it has been the practice for sometime and so the bylaw was reworded to reflect reality. Ms. Newenhizen asked whether there was counterpart for the chapters. Discussion of this question was postponed when a request for a rereading of the resolution arose. Ms. French reread the resolution and Demetrios Melis of the New York Association and also a member of the Resolutions Committee asked if the resolution could be reworded slightly to read "currently available to the association officers." John Myers of Union College was troubled by the vague language, which at a future time could be misinterpreted. He also noted that there were really two issues involved: a new officer for the Conference of Association Delegates and the issue of representation at the Senate meetings. He expressed the opinion that the resolution ought to be referred to the Senate to be fully worked out in detail and returned to the Council at the next triennial meeting. Jeff Novak of the University of Tennessee agreed with the previous comment, and urged simplicity in the bylaw rather than micro-management of details by the Council. Sam Gidas of Washington and Jefferson College agreed that details of the meetings to be attended should be stated for future understanding of present practice. Robert Entemann of St. Olaf College offered a friendly amendment, replacing the second sentence with: "The vice chair shall serve in place of the chair or secretary if either of those officers is unable to serve." President Blakely expressed the opinion that the current bylaw was confusing and modifying it at this session needed more clarity. He asked Secretary Churchill for clarification. The Secretary commented on the current practice of inviting two officers of the Conference of Association Delegates to Senate meetings under the terms already described (i.e. not to executive sessions of the Senate). He seriously urged the Council to refer the resolution to the Senate for discussion and possible future action. After further discussion on parliamentary procedure, an unidentified speaker made a motion to send the resolution to the Senate. It was then pointed out by Ms. French that Bylaw 10 guaranteed that the resolution, which dealt with basic policies and procedures, would be sent to the Senate for final consideration. An unidentified speaker made a distinction between constitutional amendments and amendments to the bylaws. He referred to Article 12 of the Constitution regarding the changing of bylaws. President Blakely noted that the problem with the resolution was that it dealt with something that didn't presently exist in the bylaws. Amendments amend the substance of what is already there; this proposal was really an addition to the bylaws, but that was not the way it has been presented to the Council. An unidentified speaker again made the motion to refer the resolution to the Senate; it was seconded, and on a voice vote, it was approved.

38. Resolutions Chair French moved on to Resolution 4, which read, "All candidates for elected office, including for uncontested offices, shall be accorded the right to address the Council during the plenary session directly prior to the Council's voting for such offices. The time allotted for each candidate shall be uniform as determined by the chair." The proposer of the resolution, Eddie Eitches of the D.C. Association, spoke for the resolution, commenting that he had spoken during the South Atlantic District meeting but without any preparation. He raised the question of why the delegates spend so much time on prospective chapters and no time on the election of Senators. He also commented on the relationship

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

between associations and chapters and felt that the present arrangement penalized candidates from associations. He felt that if he had had the opportunity to speak before the Council that he would have been elected District Senator. An unidentified speaker commented that the written statements by each candidate published in the manual seemed to be adequate to get a sense of the candidates' positions. Taking time for oral presentations would extend the meetings. Secretary Churchill commented that the order of Council business is specified in the bylaws and adding something to the agenda would complicate the timing of the election of senators, as well as the report of the Committee on Qualifications. Mr. Eitches responded that he felt the election of senators was a serious matter and five minutes devoted to each candidate could be included in the three-day session. Richard Butler of Trinity University commented that, while he sympathized with Mr. Eitches, simple mathematics would suggest that 20 candidates for Senate, even speaking only two minutes would add 40 minutes to the proceedings, and five minutes would add 100 minutes. He noted that delegates would lose attention long before all the candidates really had a chance to give their message. He urged defeat of the resolution. Mr. Eitches wished to respond, but the President ruled him out of order, allowing only two opportunities to speak on each resolution. Jules Gleicher of Rockford College raised a question of the timing of the proposed speeches, and Stephen Maurer of Swarthmore College suggested that it might be beneficial for the delegates if the Secretary and officers would give their opinion of the resolutions before they come to the floor for vote. He suggested that the Senate consider such a move. An unidentified speaker thought that candidate speeches would inform more knowledgeable voting. At this point in the debate, the question was called and a show of hands closed the debate. The vote on the resolution itself was taken by written ballot by all delegates. It was later reported that the resolution failed, 91 for and 126 against.

39. Resolutions Chair French moved on to Resolution 5: "Resolved, that the Committee on Qualifications henceforth collect and report data on the qualifications as well as the proportion of adjunct faculty at institutions recommended for chartering." The proposer of the resolution, Jennifer Maclean of Roanoke College, rose to speak to the resolution. She noted the discussions of the previous day regarding use of adjunct faculty and felt that more data would inform decisions on recommended institutions. Catherine Berheide, chair of the Committee on Qualifications, responded by asking the delegate to withdraw the resolution in the interest of time, with the assurance that the Committee on Qualifications would deal with the issue. She also announced that she would like to form a subcommittee which could create a protocol for gathering the desired information about adjunct faculty. She noted that the question of use of adjuncts was already asked but obtaining qualitative as opposed to quantitative data is much more difficult. She commented that she absolutely supported the spirit of the resolution but needed to find an efficient and effective way to accomplish it, and she invited the proposer and other interested delegates to make themselves known to her or the Secretary so they could be put to work. She went on to note that the issue of libraries would also be taken up, with a committee of volunteers who could suggest ways to evaluate libraries as they are now being transformed. The President asked the delegate from Roanoke College if she were willing to withdraw the resolution and she responded that she was, since everyone seemed to be in agreement with its spirit and that it would be implemented.

40. The President then moved on to Resolutions 6 and 7 and gave some clarifying remarks about the nature of resolutions and motion by reading Bylaw 10: "Motions and resolutions offered from the floor at council meetings shall be approved by majority vote. Motions and resolutions that involve the basic policies and procedures of the Society shall not, however, be finally disposed of at the Council in which they are proposed, but instead must be referred to the Senate for consideration." Ms. French then presented Resolution 6, which was quite lengthy, suggesting that the delegates take a few minutes to read it carefully before debating it:

The following is hereby proposed as an amendment to the Bylaws of the Phi Beta Kappa Society for consideration, in accordance with Article XII of the Constitution:

## *MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL*

Section 1: A new Bylaw 12 is hereby created to read:

1. Phi Beta Kappa shall conduct its activities in such a manner as to allow its members and its constituent bodies to have full information so as to maximize accountability and to encourage full participation. To achieve these objectives and to make Society governance more transparent, Phi Beta Kappa shall follow the policies set forth in this Bylaw.
2. Minutes of each Council meeting shall be transmitted to the Senate, to all chapters, and to all associations no later than three months after the close of any such meeting, but shall not become official until approved by the Council. Draft minutes and final minutes shall be posted on the Society Web site, and notice of their availability shall be provided in at least one Phi Beta Kappa publication that is sent to every member. Notice of such availability shall be provided by both printed and electronic means available to every Phi Beta Kappa member.
3. Minutes of each Senate meeting shall be sent to all chapters and associations no later than one month after the close of any such meeting. Except as provided in this Bylaw, such minutes shall contain detailed accounts of each committee report and the Senate's deliberations. Matters subject to litigation, negotiations with third parties, proprietary information of third parties, and personnel issues regarding members of Phi Beta Kappa's staff may be omitted and held confidential. Matters required by applicable federal, state, or local law or regulation to be held confidential shall be omitted and held confidential.
4. Minutes of Executive Committee meetings shall be sent to the Senate, to all chapters, and to all associations no later than 21 days after the close of any such meeting. Material held confidential under section 3 of this Bylaw may be excluded from such minutes, except for copies of such minutes sent to the Senate.
5. The proposed and final annual budgets of the Phi Beta Kappa Society and the Phi Beta Kappa Foundation and the complete audited statements of the Society and the Foundation required by Article V of the Constitution shall be posted on the Society Web site and made available to any Phi Beta Kappa member, chapter, or association by mail upon request.
6. All records of the Society, except those held confidential under Section 3 of this Bylaw, shall be made available to any member, chapter, or association that pays the reasonable costs of copying and transmission of said records. Policies regarding such copying and transmission shall be posted on the Society Web site and made available by mail to any Phi Beta Kappa member, chapter, or association upon request.
7. The meetings of the Council, the Senate, and national- and district-level Phi Beta Kappa committees shall be open to any Phi Beta Kappa member, provided that the presiding officer may limit attendance consistent with space available. No limit may be placed upon attendance of any Senator, the officers of the Conference of Chapter Delegates, or the officers of the Conference of Association Delegates. The right to attend does not include the right to speak or participate in the formal meeting. Executive session meetings shall be open under the foregoing conditions to any member of Phi Beta Kappa, but all matters discussed in such sessions and any records thereof shall be kept confidential among Phi Beta Kappa members only.
8. The Society Web site shall contain up-to-date rosters of all elected and appointed Phi Beta Kappa bodies and their membership, including the Senate, national-level Society committees, the Phi Beta Kappa Foundation, and chapter, association, and district leadership, setting forth individual

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

members' names and chapter or association affiliation or both. Such rosters shall be made available by mail to any Phi Beta Kappa member, chapter, or association upon request.

Section 2: This amendment shall take effect immediately upon its adoption.

After the pause for reading, she asked fellow committee member Demetrios Melis of the New York Association to discuss the procedural issues involved with the resolution, which appeared to be confused by separate parts of the constitution. He asked the proposer of the resolution, Scott Enk of the Greater Milwaukee Association, how he was proposing the resolution and under what provisions of the constitution. Mr. Enk continued his discussion until the President noted that the Council would be following the procedures for adopting resolutions. The Parliamentarian, Ms. Cabey, commented at this point that the bylaws are confusing, but it appeared to her that this was being presented as a resolution, not a bylaw or constitutional change. Mr. Enk responded that the resolution was being presented as an amendment. Ms. Cabey continued her comments by saying that it was her interpretation of the constitution that the proposal was for a change in policies and procedure and therefore must be referred to the Senate and not enacted immediately. Mr. Enk then requested the remaining five minutes of his time to speak for the resolution and noted that the ruling seemed to contradict precedents. He then explained the purpose of his resolution, which was to guarantee transparency and openness within the Society. He commented that any future capital campaign would depend on a wide membership, and the resolution (amendment) sought to include anyone interested in the Senate deliberations. Following Mr. Enk's comments, John Myers of Union College proposed a replacement resolution:

Whereas amendment to the bylaws is not to be lightly undertaken, and whereas such an undertaking warrants extensive deliberation and consultation, and whereas Resolution 6, as submitted to the 41<sup>st</sup> Triennial Council, may place an onerous burden on the Society, and whereas the value and merit of transparency in the activities of the Society is acknowledged, therefore be it resolved that a bylaw amendment on transparency is referred to the Phi Beta Kappa Senate for further development and resubmission with recommendations to the 42<sup>nd</sup> Triennial Council of the Society.

President Blakely ruled this substitution out of order since it was in direct opposition to the resolution itself. Senator John Doner from the University of California-Santa Barbara commented that he was troubled by several things due to the complexity of the resolution. He agreed that transparency was laudable but felt that the resolution micro-managed it, especially when it came to technology. Charles Caldwell of the Houston Association again raised the question of whether the proposal was an amendment or a resolution and asked that the President's interpretation be reconsidered. President Blakely responded that amendments to the bylaws cannot be made and become effective at the same Council. The Resolutions Committee is a screening committee, not a deliberative committee that presents proposed amendments that have been carefully considered and voted upon favorably. Stephen Maurer of Swarthmore College rose to speak to the substance of the resolution, which he felt was well-intentioned but was couched in obligatory terms that could pose problems for the Society. Past President Niall Slater commented on the distribution of the minutes of the Senate, the Executive Committee of the Senate, the Foundation, and the Executive Committee of the Foundation after they have been approved by each body. He noted that the resolution would require minutes to be distributed before they had been duly approved. He recommended defeat of the resolution, even though he had sympathy for its substance.

Harvey Klehr, former senator and chair of the Committee on Chapters, commented that the resolution would make the work of that committee impossible because the committee often discusses the workings of local chapters and their leadership, particularly those that are having problems, and this information should not be made public. He also said that requiring confidentiality of information among Phi Beta Kappa members attending Senate meetings would be unenforceable and a prescription for disaster.

## *MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL*

Secretary Churchill added his comments at this point, agreeing with Professors Doner, Slater, and Klehr while being sympathetic to the issue of transparency. He felt that passage of the resolution would create fundamental changes in the way the Society conducts much of its essential business. An unidentified speaker posed an amendment to the resolution, deleting the final sentence and substituting: "The right to attend does not include the right to speak or participate in the formal meeting, nor to attend when the meeting has resolved into executive session." He noted that items discussed in executive session often have serious legal implications. The motion to amend was seconded. There was no discussion on the amendment and on a vote by a show of hands, it failed. Alexandra Anderson of Southwestern University again asked for clarity on the procedural difference between an amendment and a bylaw resolution. The President responded that the real issue was whether or not such changes can be approved in one council meeting, and the rules do not allow that. Ms. Anderson asked how such amendment proposals could be made, and the President referred to the previous discussion and rulings. C. O. Patterson of Texas A&M expressed the concern that, as written, the resolution allowed for access through the Web site to local chapter data and names, which could be used to unfairly solicit members. He was uneasy about the implications of the resolution. An unidentified speaker commented that the protracted discussion had made it clear that there are some serious ambiguities in the bylaws and procedures of the organization, and he recommended that the Senate consider this problem so as to avoid a similar situation in the future. He called the question on the resolution. A second was heard, and the President called for a voice vote, which approved closing discussion. Balloting on the resolution then followed. The tally of votes showed 5 votes in favor and 202 against, so the resolution failed. The President made a final comment about changes in policies and procedure, which require advance notice. They cannot be made from the floor, decided upon, and immediately go into effect. His comments elicited a response from Robert Lowman of the University of North Carolina–Chapel Hill, who disagreed with the President and noted the existence of a super majority rule which could enable bylaw changes to be made without advance notice. President Blakely acknowledged the disagreement but referred to Bylaw 10, which gives the presiding officer the power to decide which kinds of motions have to be referred to the Senate before they can be enacted.

41. Ms. French continued with the report of the Resolutions Committee by presenting Resolution 7. It addressed Bylaw 10 and struck all the language in the first paragraph except the first sentence, proposing that Bylaw 10 would read: "Motions and resolutions offered from the floor at council meetings shall be approved by majority vote. This amendment shall take effect immediately upon its adoption." The President called upon Scott Enk, the proposer, for his comments, but Mr. Enk deferred, to hear other comments. Robert Lowman of the University of North Carolina–Chapel Hill spoke against the resolution because he felt it was a bad idea to overrule the present constitutional procedures in this way. Calvin Van Niewaal of Coe College, noting the lateness of the hour and the chair's ruling that these matters would be referred to the Senate, moved that the resolution be immediately referred to the Senate. A second was heard. President Blakely called upon Mr. Enk for his comment; he again reiterated his position on transparency and procedures and accused the Society of not wanting to change. He suggested that he was willing to withdraw the motion and wait to see what the Senate would do with it. Several unidentified delegates spoke against referral to the Senate. Charles Blake of the Shenandoah Association commented that from all he had heard throughout the afternoon, it was clear that the Resolutions Committee had not separated out motions involving policies and procedures and that this had placed the presiding officer in a difficult position of having to make the judgment of what would have to be referred to the Senate. He commended President Blakely for making a good faith effort to use his power so that the delegates could take serious matters seriously. He considered resolutions 6 and 7 to be serious matters and thus they should be given further consideration by the Senate, and he called the question on debate of resolution 7. A show of hands closed the debate. On the resolution itself, a paper ballot was used and resulted in 94 in favor and 88 against, so the resolution was referred to the Senate.



*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

42. The President thanked Ms. French for her service and called upon Secretary Churchill for announcements. The Secretary reminded the representatives of the newly elected chapters to meet Sunday morning at 9:30. He also noted the times for the Council reception and banquet that evening.

43. President Blakely also announced that the 42<sup>nd</sup> Triennial Council would be held in Austin, Texas, October 1-4, 2009. He also reminded the delegates to submit their expense vouchers within 90 days to the national office for reimbursement.

44. President Blakely adjourned the 41<sup>st</sup> Triennial Council *sine die*.

*MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL*

**COUNCIL SYMPOSIA**

OCTOBER 26-28, 2006

Throughout the Council, Phi Beta Kappa celebrated the 50th Anniversary of the Visiting Scholar Program with a series of symposia that were comprised of lectures by Phi Beta Kappa Visiting Scholars.

**THURSDAY, OCTOBER 26**

*Introduced by Helen North, Centennial Professor of Classics Emerita, Swarthmore College  
Chairman, Visiting Scholar Committee*

**American Higher Education: 50 Years Back, 50 Years Ahead**

Dennis O'Brien, President Emeritus, University of Rochester  
N. Katherine Hayles, Hillis Professor of Literature, UCLA

**FRIDAY, OCTOBER 27**

*Introduced by Werner Gundersheimer, Director Emeritus, Folger Shakespeare Library  
Former Chairman, Visiting Scholar Committee*

**The Transformation of the Roman Year**

Elaine Fantham, Giger Professor of Latin Emerita, Princeton University  
*(Read by President Niall W. Slater)*

**A Problem in Human Geography: What If the Objects of Our Study Are Our Intellectual Peers?**

Yi-Fu Tuan, J. K. Wright and Vilas Professor Emeritus, University of Wisconsin-Madison

**SATURDAY, OCTOBER 28**

*Introduced by Neil Harris, Preston and Sterling Morton Professor of History, University of Chicago  
Former Chairman, Visiting Scholar Committee*

**Change and Continuity on the Supreme Court**

Linda Greenhouse, Supreme Court Correspondent, *New York Times*

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

**FIFTY YEARS OF VISITING SCHOLARS**

*By Helen F. North*  
*Centennial Professor of Classics Emerita, Swarthmore College*  
*Chairman, Visiting Scholar Committee*

In the Middle Ages, centers of learning such as Paris, Orleans, and Chartres were familiar with what were known as *Vagantes*, Wandering Scholars, who had a unique place in the transmission of knowledge and the development of European culture from the 10th century to the end of the 13th. So, too, American centers of learning over the last 50 years have become familiar with the Phi Beta Kappa Visiting Scholars. They were, in fact, provisionally named Itinerant Scholars, surely a reminiscence of their mediaeval forebears, but their present title was approved when the program was established by the Triennial Council of 1955, and it is as Visiting Scholars that we salute them this year and celebrate their half-century of service to liberal education.

As early as 1949, the Committee on Chapter Activities had reported to the Council that the most helpful activity of the chapters is the provision of lectures by distinguished scholars. Inspired by this observation, the Committee on Policy in its report to the Senate on December 4, 1954, proposed that the United Chapters of Phi Beta Kappa develop a program of lectures providing for the appointment annually of one or more distinguished scholars, each of whom would spend two to three days at each of 10 or 15 Phi Beta Kappa-sheltering institutions desiring to participate in the program. Their activities were briefly described as giving one public lecture and rendering "whatever other service to the institution and academic community as might appropriately be arranged."

From such modest and experimental beginnings, the program took root and flourished. In that first momentous year (1956-57), five Visiting Scholars were appointed, four men and one woman (as Aesop might have said, "one, but a lion" — or rather a lioness, for she was Lily Ross Taylor of Bryn Mawr, the finest Latinist of her day). Out of 163 chapters, 32 requested visits, and 29 were accommodated. By comparison, in 2005-06 we had 270 chapters, 146 requests, 13 Scholars, and 101 chapters were visited. The total number of visits from 1956-57 to 2005-06 was 4,450, and the total number of Visiting Scholars to date is 529. To read the names of these scholars is to scroll through American intellectual life in the last half-century, identifying the dominant figures in the three major categories from which they have been chosen: humanities, social and behavioral sciences, and natural sciences, with their many subdivisions. Not all Visiting Scholars have been members of Phi Beta Kappa, nor were they all from academic life, and a few have come from other countries, like Sean O'Faolain from Ireland and H.D.F. Kitto from England.

How has this increasingly complicated program operated? Each triennium, a Committee on the Visiting Scholar Program is appointed. The committee is usually composed of a dozen or so members, some of them Phi Beta Kappa Senators and others non-Senators, chosen because of their familiarity with fields not covered by the Senators. Many committee members have served as Visiting Scholars themselves. Up to now, there have been 53 committee members, all trying to live up to the example of such 1955 pioneers as Marjorie Hope Nicholson and Helen C. White. So far, five men and three women have chaired the committee, and, in the opinion of at least one chairman, they have the best assignment of all committee heads. This enthusiasm is due, in part, to the intrinsic value of the program and the abiding interest in scrutinizing from year to year the wealth and diversity of American academic culture. It is also due to the superb direction provided by the national office once the program is set up each year. During all these years that direction has been provided by only two women, Frances Robb and Kathy Navascues. Frances Robb directed the program from 1955 until 1977 and then worked part time until she retired in 1991. It was she who set up the program in very much the way it is run today. Kathy Navascues worked with her from 1969 to 1977 and became director in 1977. To appreciate the expertise and tact with which she coordinates the program every year, we need only read the comments by Werner Gundersheimer in the summer 2005 issue of *The Key Reporter*. He calls Kathy "one of Washington's more accomplished diplomats," but in fact, that is an understatement.

## MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL

The original intent of the program was to give priority to those chapters located at institutions where opportunities were not already abundant for public lectures of a scholarly nature and where the presence of a Visiting Scholar would be most likely to contribute towards enriching the intellectual life of the academic community. This is still a basic aim. Small, relatively isolated liberal arts colleges throughout the country receive preference in the assignment of Visiting Scholars, as do those chapters whose requests in the previous year have had to be refused.

When a request is granted, the success of a visit depends in large measure on the skill and enthusiasm with which the lucky chapter tackles its job. It is no small burden, and the already overworked chapter officers deserve the utmost praise for all they do to ensure this success. The chapter works with the interested departments in setting up a two-day campus program that will bring together many students, faculty, and members of local Phi Beta Kappa associations and provide a wide variety of opportunities for the exchange of ideas, ranging from large public lectures to discussions with individual students and faculty and, on occasion, with administrators. Reports from the chapters often describe the advice on graduate study or career plans offered to a single person by a generous Visiting Scholar, in addition to the inspiration afforded by electrifying lectures delivered by world-famous leaders in their fields. It is especially gratifying to learn of occasions on which the Visiting Scholar has been the agent for winning stronger support on the part of an administration for a neglected liberal arts program.

And what of the Visiting Scholars who regularly report themselves as exhausted, but reinvigorated, by their experiences? Their accounts are fascinating, so often do they reveal the unique character of a college, its strengths, its struggles, its dedication to learning. It is not uncommon for Visiting Scholars to come away from their year of visits with a new perspective on their own work, a significant broadening of their experience, even a renewed inspiration for future scholarship. One example may stand for all. Freeman Dyson of the Institute for Advanced Study, one of the few scholars invited to renew his engagement for a second term, dedicated his book *Disturbing the Universe* to the students he met during his first Visiting Scholar tour in 1975-76. Listing every one of the eight colleges and universities he visited, he says, "They asked the questions, which this book tries to answer." Such a symbiosis is not unique.

To keep all this happening is the challenge that confronts us now. The future will see no lack of Visiting Scholars or of chapters eager to invite them, but there will be a growing need for adequate funding to support them. The Updike Memorial Fund, which has supported two visits by one humanities scholar each year since 2000, offers an example of what might be done on a much larger scale, and the Society will explore other avenues as they open up. As we look ahead to the next 50 years, we can foresee many changes in the academic culture that we exist to nourish. Many others will surprise us. Whatever they may be, the love of wisdom, which Plato assures us is the steersman of life, will continue to be our guide.

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

**COUNCIL BANQUET**  
October 28, 2006

The 41st Triennial Council banquet was held the evening of Saturday, October 28, in the Peachtree Ballroom of the Westin Peachtree Plaza.

Gerald Early, Merle Kling Professor of Modern Letters at Washington University in St. Louis, received the award for Distinguished Service to the Humanities. Gerald Early is a fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, and he has served frequently as a consultant on the production of documentary films, such as those by Ken Burns on baseball and jazz, both of which aired to great acclaim in their premieres on the Public Broadcast System. He has been nominated for two Grammy Awards in the category of Best Album Notes for *Yes I Can: The Sammy Davis, Jr., Story* and *Rhapsodies in Black: Music and Words from the Harlem Renaissance*.

Charles Tilly, Joseph L. Bottenwieser Professor of Social Science at Columbia University, received the Sidney Hook Memorial Award, which underwrites an address at the Council banquet by a distinguished teacher and scholar. His address appears below.

**Awards, Credit, and Blame**

**Charles Tilly**

During the turbulent year of 1929, two interesting events occurred, with deep but very different impacts on American life. In October a shocked country faced a stock-market crash that ushered in the great depression of the 1930s. Four months earlier, on the 16<sup>th</sup> of May, the first Academy Awards ceremony took place at a banquet in the Blossom Room of Los Angeles' Hollywood Roosevelt Hotel. World War II pulled the US out of its long depression, but the Academy Awards have never ceased.

The Academy of Motion Picture Arts and Sciences formed in 1927, but took two years to arrive at its winning formula. Three quarters of a century later, the Academy now gives 24 major annual awards plus a variable number of scientific, technical, and auxiliary commendations. Its vividly televised and heavily scripted ceremony has become one of the year's major media events. Both in America and overseas, in film and other performance arts alike, the Academy Awards have spurred the highest form of compliment - imitation, right down to the use of statuettes and other icons to represent the award. France's Césars, Canada's Genies, and China's Golden Roosters all pay homage to Oscar. The Spanish Motion Picture Academy gives its winners a bust of painter Francisco de Goya. Oscar shapes film production across the world.

Although I have never watched the Academy Awards, I started digging into their history for a book on credit and blame: How do people assign each other credit and blame? Do the same social processes generate one and the other? Why do people care so much about the proper assignment of credit and blame? In the few minutes we have available here, let me focus, appropriately for the occasion, on giving credit.

Philip Seymour Hoffman, who had portrayed Truman Capote in the film *Capote*, won the 2005 leading actor award for that role. As he accepted the award at the March 2006 gala, he spoke these words:

Wow. I'm in a category with some great, great, great actors. Fantastic actors, and I'm overwhelmed. I'm really overwhelmed.

He went on to thank nine people before getting to his mother. The star of *Capote* recognized in 2006 that he had arrived at the moment for taking credit, but also—emphatically—for sharing it. Within tight time

## MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL

limits, awardees regularly combine expressions of amazement at their good fortune with gushing thanks to collaborators, family, and friends. They follow a standard American credit-taking script.

Oscar specialist Emanuel Levy sums up the place of Academy Awards in recent American culture:

Is it too much to suggest that standing on the Oscar podium and thanking your family and friends—and every person you have ever met in your life—has become the ultimate American fantasy? The strong need to be recognized, the urge to be acknowledged in public, the desire to grab the spotlight. Not for fifteen minutes of fame, as Andy Warhol predicted in the 1960s—that's too long. A forty-five-second speech, which is the Academy's prescribed norm, will do, or swelling music will interrupt your speech in mid-sentence. Unless, of course, you're Julia Roberts or Warren Beatty, whose speeches have been some of the longest in Oscar's history.

Jane Wyman brought down the average time in 1949 when she accepted the award for her part as a deaf-mute in *Johnny Belinda*. Her entire speech ran as follows: "I accept this very gratefully for keeping my mouth shut for once. I think I'll do it again." On the whole, however, Oscar winners have filled their 45 seconds of immortality with words, words, words. Like victorious finalists at Wimbledon or the World Cup, they have won their matches, and arrived at glory.

Here is how credit works. Whether someone (like Julia Roberts or Warren Beatty) is taking credit or someone else (like the 2006 Oscar host, comedian Jon Stewart) is giving credit, they are claiming that the recipient did something that actually caused an increase in the value of something important. The best actress in a leading role outdid her competitors in adding to the value of her film. What's more, she wasn't simply the creature of circumstances or other people's help: through deliberate deployment of her talent, she caused a better film to come out.

As the acceptance speech's references to collaborators, friends, and family indicates, furthermore, taking or giving credit draws a line between deserving insiders and everyone else. Participants in taking or giving credit package credit's elements—competence, responsibility, outcome, and us-them boundary—in recognizable stories. If someone deviates too far from that script, someone else always pops up to correct them. At least offscreen, furthermore, some rival or some member of an excluded faction always complains that the wrong person or faction got the credit.

Humans have, however, invented four somewhat different ways of fitting the elements together: tournaments, honors, promotions, and networks:

- In *tournaments*, a process of competitive elimination starts with plenty of candidates but ends with only one winner—an individual or a team—in each category.
- In *honors*, present members of a select group accept nominations of current outsiders from other members, and organize a screening process to decide who is worthy to join them.
- In *promotions*, a whole class of people who have reached a certain rank goes through some sort of screening that determines which of them advances into the next higher rank.
- In *networks*, people draw on local scripts and resources to distinguish other people whose performances deserve credit.

In all four modes, the givers and claimers of credit are declaring that someone—or a bunch of someones—has added value to some significant enterprise through competent, responsible performance.

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

They are also saying that the performance puts the receiver of credit on the good side of an us-them boundary.

The categories overlap a bit. For example, in some honorary societies an elite board of judges selects the newcomers, more like a tournament. In others, the whole membership votes on who can join them, yet sometimes a single member can blackball a candidate. Phi Beta Kappa clearly centers on honors, but sometimes, as we see here, awards tournament-style prizes as well.

The Oscars amount to an annual tournament, but membership in the Academy of Motion Picture Arts and Sciences comes closer to the honors model. School graduations typically involve promotions, although in some elite schools they also borrow from honors. Promotions within ranked organizations usually operate more selectively than school graduations; some members get them, most don't. In that regard, they come closer to tournaments and honors than school graduations do. Everyday awarding of credit, however, rarely follows the patterns of tournaments, honors, or promotions. Instead, it depends on story-telling within local networks.

My Columbia University colleague Eric Kandel shared the Nobel Prize for Physiology or Medicine. His powerful memoir *In Search of Memory* chronicles the life and work that produced his discoveries concerning how memory operates. It begins with his family's flight from Vienna in 1938 as the Nazis took over, and ends with the prize's aftermath. On Yom Kippur 2000, he tells us, his New York telephone rang at 5:15 AM. The Nobel Foundation's secretary general was calling to tell him about the prize. Comments Kandel:

The Stockholm deliberations must be among the best-kept secrets in the world. There are practically never any leaks. As a result, it is almost impossible to know who will get the prize in any given October. Yet very few people who receive the Nobel Prize are absolutely astonished by the very idea of winning it. Most people who are eligible sense that they are being considered because their colleagues speak of the possibility. Moreover, the Karolinska Institute runs periodic symposia designed to bring the world's leading biologists to Stockholm, and I had just attended such a symposium a few weeks earlier. Nonetheless I had not expected this call. Many eminently prizeworthy candidates who are talked about as being eligible are never selected as laureates, and I thought it unlikely that I would be recognized.

Kandel is describing his arrival at a tournament's top. Like Oscar winners, he takes pains to share the credit. Yet he also recognizes that his scientific performance was "prizeworthy."

You might think that the world of academic prizes stands aloof from the tournament-style campaigning that regularly besets the Oscars and other entertainment awards like it. But let me report what an economist from the Swedish Academy told me in 1996. The Swedish Academy awards the Nobel Prizes in economics. It gets the money from the Swedish Riksbank rather than the Nobel Foundation. That doesn't devalue the prize, or make contenders less eager to win it. "We have no trouble," laughed the economist, "getting promising economists to speak in Stockholm. In fact, they're often willing to pay their own way." No Hedda Hopper publishes the gossip of economics, but there and elsewhere in academia plenty of discreet politicking surrounds major prizes.

Should we be surprised? Even organizations that tend to promote and reward people on the basis of competent performance and staying out of trouble rather than individual brilliance usually award them signs that they have made it up through the ranks. Nevertheless, the worlds in which prizes count most resemble tournaments. Consider the worlds of novelists, poets, painters, dancers, runners, boxers, jazz musicians, and motion picture actors. They involve innumerable participants, part time or full time, at the lower ranks, but only a handful who receive recognition at the top. Although some people stick with these

## MINUTES OF THE FORTY-FIRST COUNCIL

competitive activities for the pleasure, the adventure, or the scent of blood, most never receive the credit they think they deserve. The world of American academia is a bit more benign. A competent performer often moves up rank by rank without ever becoming famous or winning big prizes. But at its higher levels, like military services, academia shifts to tournament structures. Among an elite, competition for credit, including prizes up to and including Nobel Prizes, becomes acute and sometimes fierce.

A negative example proves the point. In 2002, Russian mathematician Grigory Perelman began publishing proofs of a conjecture by Frenchman Henri Poincaré, who died in 1912. The conjecture concerns characteristics of three-dimensional spheres. Not only had the proof eluded mathematicians for a century, but the Clay Mathematics Institute had announced a million-dollar prize for a valid solution to the problem. Building on the work of American Richard Hamilton, Perelman proposed an unconventional, sophisticated solution. By 2006, knowledgeable mathematicians across the world had validated Perelman's proof.

A committee of the International Mathematical Union voted to award forty-year-old Perelman a Fields Medal, the world's chief recognition for mathematicians forty and younger. Yet Chinese-American mathematician Shing-Tung Yau (himself an earlier winner of the Fields Medal for his work on what came to be called Calabi-Yau manifolds) challenged Perelman's priority, arguing that his students Xi-Ping Zhu and Huai-Dong Cao had provided the definitive proof. Specialist Dan Stroock of MIT complained: "Calabi outlined a program," Stroock said. "In a real sense, Yau was Calabi's Perelman. Now he's on the other side. He's had no compunction at all in taking the lion's share of credit for Calabi-Yau. And now he seems to be resenting Perelman getting credit for completing Hamilton's program. I don't know if the analogy has ever occurred to him."

Perelman turned the tables on everyone. He refused the Fields Medal, failed to apply for the million-dollar prize, and retired to his small research center in St. Petersburg, Russia. Yet in this particular fierce tournament, it seems likely that historians of mathematics will declare him the winner—give him the credit. In a letter to the *New Yorker*, Stroock added a qualifying comment on Perelman and Yau: "Of course, the rest of us are jealous of their immortality, but our jealousy does not excuse our succumbing to the crab-bucket syndrome." Crabs in a bucket claw and chew each other up instead of respectfully awarding credit to the best among them. Academic tournaments often turn into crab buckets.

Thank you for saving me from the crabs.



*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

**NEW ENGLAND DISTRICT**

District Chair Katherine R. Soule called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m. The minutes of the previous meeting were approved as published in the *Phi Beta Kappa Bulletin 40<sup>th</sup> Triennial Council*.

There being no funds or treasurer, there was no treasurer's report.

Chair Soule reported on associations in the New England district.

The district's newest association, Northern New England Association, encompassing Northern Vermont and Northwestern New Hampshire, was granted a charter at this triennial. The association was founded September 28, 2004. The association has approximately 30 members and has held four events.

The Maine Association continues to have a strong membership base. They hold two events annually and continue to offer awards to high school students.

Maggie Lee reported on the Boston Association. Founded in 2001, this association has approximately 25 paid members and over 70 prospective members. Many of their events are centered around area cultural events. They also hold an annual event with a lecture, most recently featuring Meaghan Marshall.

Chair Soule expressed the district officers' interest in promoting more associations and asked members to contact her if they are interested in starting an association.

Chair Soule reported on the periodic electronic newsletters initiated since the 40<sup>th</sup> triennial, since the district has no dues or treasury for doing a mailing. District officers are interested in maintaining communications between triennials. She requested members send any news to either Chair Soule or Secretary O'Donnell.

Chair Soule reported that Patrick Farmer, Chapter Relations Coordinator, visited various chapters last spring. Howard Segal mentioned Patrick had visited the University of Maine on the day of their initiation ceremony. He thought it was an excellent visit and would send the District officers information. Chair Soule volunteered to attend visits with Patrick and offered to attend events or speak.

Chair Soule discussed district officers meetings and the current make up of the executive committee. Currently, the executive committee consists of the Chair, Secretary, District Senator, Past Chair, and Past District Senator. Chair Soule proposed adding a Vice Chair and encouraged nominations.

Chair Soule turned the meeting over to District Senator Wyatt for a report on the Senate and on the Committee on Qualifications.

Senator Wyatt reported as Senator he has been contributing to the continuing discussion on the shape and direction of strategic planning for the Society's capital campaign. He encouraged people to attend the breakout sessions on "Future Initiatives for the Phi Beta Kappa Society."

## *MINUTES OF THE DISTRICT MEETINGS*

In his role as New England District Senator he has been lending support to chapters. He also has been serving on the Committee for Qualifications. As a result of his service, he has maintained an abiding interest in the health and well being of the district's newest chapter, St. Michael's College, Gamma of Vermont, established in 2004.

Senator Wyatt reported that the Committee on Qualifications was forwarding six candidate institutions at this triennial, unfortunately none from New England. As a member of the committee he participated in site visits to three of the six and can speak to the candidacy of those.

Senator Wyatt reported that he has also served as Chair of the Senate's Committee on Awards. Gerald Early of Washington University will be receiving the Award for Distinguished Service to the Humanities. Charles Tilly of Columbia University will be receiving the Sidney Hook Memorial Award.

Finally, Senator Wyatt spoke to his candidacy for re-election to the New England District Senator and introduced the other candidate, Lisa Newton of Fairfield University.

Chair Soule then called for the election of district officers. The district executive committee put forward two district office candidates: Kate Soule for Chair, Carol O'Donnell for Secretary. The slate was unanimously approved.

For Vice Chair Howard Segal nominated Kathryn Olmstead. Carol O'Donnell nominated Lisa Newton. Kathryn Olmstead was elected.

Chair Soule called attention to the council agenda and the specific pages pertaining to council proceedings, voting instructions, report of the Senate, report of the Council Nominating Committee and nominee statements, and the report of the Committee on Qualifications. Chair Soule also named the candidates from New England for Senate seats.

Chair Soule turned to new business. The National Office has decided to provide \$2,500 to each district. Chair Soule asked for suggestions of how the District might use those funds. Discussion ensued as to whether the District should have a treasurer. Lisa Newton nominated Edward O'Neill, who respectfully declined. Caldwell Titcomb suggested making the Secretary's position a Secretary/Treasurer position. This suggestion was unanimously accepted. Chair Soule asked people to email ideas to either herself or Secretary/Treasurer O'Donnell.

Joe Gordon recognized Kathy Navascues, Director of Visiting Scholar Programs, and asked her to speak about the triennial symposia.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,  
Carol O'Donnell  
District Secretary/Treasurer

In attendance:  
Z. Philip Ambrose, University of Vermont  
Joseph W. Bartolomeo, University of Massachusetts  
Kimberly Benard, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Tom Berger, Colby College

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

Allison Blakely, Boston University, Senator  
Amy Cembor, Wheaton College  
Joseph W. Gordon, Yale University, Senator  
Bruce Hawkins, Smith College  
Daniel Heischman, Trinity College  
Linda Johnson, University of New Hampshire  
John Kenney, St. Michael's College  
Maggie Lee, Boston Association  
George Levesque, Yale University  
Jocelyn Linnekin, University of Connecticut  
Gerald Mager, Amherst College  
Kathy Navascues, Director of Visiting Scholar Programs, PBK National  
Lisa Newton, Fairfield University  
Clare O'Connor, Boston College  
Carol O'Donnell, District Secretary  
Kathryn Olmstead, University of Maine  
Edward J. O'Neill, Fairfield University  
Howard Segal, University of Maine  
Wayne Snyder, Boston University  
Kate Soule, Dartmouth College, District Chair  
Caldwell Titcomb, Brandeis University  
Judith Vichniac, Harvard University  
Katie Wood, University of Rhode Island  
Don J. Wyatt, Middlebury College, Senator

**MIDDLE ATLANTIC DISTRICT**

The meeting of the Middle Atlantic District, held in the Plaza Ballroom A of the Westin Peachtree Plaza Hotel in Atlanta, Georgia, was called to order by President C. Howard Krukofsky at 4:04 p.m. on October 26, 2006. Delegates from at least 28 chapters and three associations were present.

As first order of business, the minutes of the 2003 District Conference were accepted as distributed. This was followed by the President's Report, in which Professor Krukofsky spoke about the constituency and accomplishments. He reported that at last count the District consists of 57 chapters and six associations. The Middle Atlantic District is unique in having presented in each of the last four triennia a symposium that has attracted large audiences. It is the most active District in the country. Professor Krukofsky went on to provide details about the symposium, entitled "Morality and the Phi Beta Kappa Mission," that had been held in Philadelphia on October 15, 2005, on the campus of the University of Pennsylvania, hosted by Delta Chapter. In concluding his report, Professor Krukofsky, who is retiring, thanked his District colleagues for their help, support, and friendship. He felt honored to have been in the position of president, and expressed his very best wishes for the future.

Professor Vera L. Junkers presented the Treasurer's Report. Income from chapter and association dues was comparable to that of the previous triennium, but since dues had been raised, the actual number of contributing institutions had diminished somewhat. Symposium expenses were met through contributions from PBK's national office, the Delaware Valley Association, Delta

## *MINUTES OF THE DISTRICT MEETINGS*

Chapter of Pennsylvania, and the Middle Atlantic District. A balance of over \$1000 remained in the treasury. The report was accepted.

District Senator Theopolis Fair presented a report on Senate activities. He provided a hand-out detailing projects, fundraising, directions to take, and the Spellings Commission Report. He summarized the major points of the Commission Report, i.e. concerns about student opportunities for post-secondary education, the cost of education, performance assessment with a view to meeting the challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> century, and the insufficiency of teaching in technical fields.

Since the College of New Jersey, one of the institutions seeking a chapter charter, is located in the Middle Atlantic District, Professor Catherine W. Berheide, Chair of the Committee on Qualifications, was asked to review the procedures involved in the qualifications process. She made clear the length, depth, and breadth of the three-year process, and noted that the selection committee can use more members.

The next item on the agenda was a proposed amendment to the District By-Laws. A motion was made and seconded to approve the Executive Committee's proposal that the District Senator be officially included in the Executive Committee (Article V, paragraph 2). A follow-up motion was made and seconded to add the phrase "except in the case of the District Senator, who will be appointed by the Senate" to the existing Article V, paragraph 3. The latter is to read, "A vacancy in the Executive Committee shall be filled for the remainder of the term by the Executive Committee, except in the case of the District Senator, who will be appointed by the Senate." Both motions were passed.

The report of the District Nominating Committee was presented by Professor Krukofsky. Candidates for the three officers and for the Representative for Upper New York, running unopposed, were all elected by voice vote. Professor Rebecca Connor and Professor Douglas E. Norton, candidates for Representative for Metropolitan New York and Pennsylvania/Delaware, respectively, addressed the delegates. Statements were made and read on behalf of candidates unable to attend the District meeting. The election, concluded by written ballot, yielded the following results: President: Joseph Poluka (Delaware Valley Association), Vice-President: John A. Delgrosso (New York University), Secretary-Treasurer: Vera L. Junkers (Hunter College), Representative for Upper New York: Lloyd Raines (Scarsdale/Westchester Association), Representative for Metropolitan New York: Rebecca Conner (Hunter College), Representative for Pennsylvania/Delaware: Douglas E. Norton (Villanova University).

Discussion of District activities/initiatives for the 2006-2009 Triennium began with ideas presented by Professor Joseph E. Devine of Carnegie Mellon University. He addressed the issue of increasing chapter and association interactions within the District. There was a consensus that a symposium be arranged again; suggestions included revisiting the subject of morality and raising environmental issues.

Current business elicited the proposal by Professor Thomas E. Bird for a "Resolution of Appreciation." Adopted by acclamation, it reads as follows:

"Whereas, Professor C. Howard Krukofsky has served  
the Middle Atlantic District as Vice-President for one term and as President for  
three full triennia, and  
Whereas, he has served in these demanding leadership  
roles with distinction, and

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

Whereas, he has brought competence, enthusiasm, and imagination to the challenges of these offices, and  
Whereas, during his tenure the District has witnessed a rationalization of procedures, a clarification of rules, and the successful conduct of three stimulating symposia, and  
Whereas, he is leaving the District in sound financial condition, with an enlarged and invigorated membership, and a high level of morale,  
Therefore, the delegates attending the Middle Atlantic District meeting held in Atlanta, Georgia, on October 26, 2006, hereby record our deep admiration and warm thanks to Professor Krukofsky and order this resolution to be spread on the minutes of this meeting.”

In the absence of new business, this District meeting was adjourned at 5:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,  
Vera L. Junkers  
Secretary-Treasurer

In attendance:

Margaret Arnesen, Pi of New York, Elmira College  
Catherine W. Berheide, Senator, Phi of New York, Skidmore College  
Thomas E. Bird, Sigma of New York, Queens College  
Barbara Jane Bono, Omicron of New York, SUNY at Buffalo  
Edward S. Boylan, Alpha of New Jersey, Rutgers University-Newark College  
Rebecca Elisabeth Connor, Nu of New York, Hunter College, CUNY  
William Robert Cook, Alpha Delta of New York, SUNY College At Geneseo  
John Anthony Delgrosso, Beta of New York, New York University  
Joseph Edward Devine, Upsilon of Pennsylvania, Carnegie Mellon University  
Theopolis Fair, Middle Atlantic District Senator  
Wanda Jean Finney, Nu of Pennsylvania, Wilson College  
Kay Fiset, Kappa of New York, Syracuse University  
Nancy R. Freudenthal, The College of New Jersey  
Jay Daniels Friedenber, Upsilon of New York, Manhattan College  
Deborah Ann Gagnon, Xi of New York, Wells College  
Sam Peter Gidas, Kappa of Pennsylvania, Washington & Jefferson College  
Daniel R. Gilbert, Jr., Iota of Pennsylvania, Gettysburg College  
Norman Girardot, Beta of Pennsylvania, Lehigh University  
Madeline Einhorn Glick, Senator  
Jean Golden, PBK Association of New York City  
Thomas Allen Greenfield, Alpha Delta of New York, SUNY College At Geneseo  
Catherine S. Grigor, Lambda of Pennsylvania, Pennsylvania State University  
David Grossvogel, Theta of New York, Cornell University  
Lisa Tremper Hanover, Tau of Pennsylvania, Ursinus College

## *MINUTES OF THE DISTRICT MEETINGS*

Keith Harrow, Rho of New York, Brooklyn College, CUNY  
Stephen Mark Houghton, Pittsburgh Association  
Joseph Samuel Houser, Theta of Pennsylvania, Franklin and Marshall College  
George C. Hudson, Jr., Eta of New York, Colgate University  
Mark E. Huibregtse, Phi of New York, Skidmore College  
Lucille Lewis Johnson, Mu of New York, Vassar College  
Vera L. Junkers, Middle Atlantic District Secretary Nu of New York, Hunter College, CUNY  
Gloria B. Karin, PBK Upper Hudson Association  
Joseph Walter Koterski, Tau of New York, Fordham University  
C. Howard Krukofsky, Middle Atlantic District, Chair  
Roger Lehecka, Delta of New York, Columbia University  
Jonathan Edward Lewis, Fellow  
Charlotte E. Lott, Omicron of Pennsylvania, Chatham College  
Rebecca Ellen Martin, Pace University  
Stephen B. Maurer, Epsilon of Pennsylvania, Swarthmore College  
Tara L. Eberhardt McKee, Epsilon of New York, Hamilton College  
Demetrios George Melis, PBK Association of New York City  
Milene Z. Morfei, Xi of New York, Wells College  
Dean Marjorie W. Munson, Alpha of New Jersey, Rutgers University–Douglass College  
John Frank Myers, IV, Alpha of New York, Union College  
Helen F. North, Swarthmore College  
Douglas Evatt Norton, Sigma of Pennsylvania, Villanova University  
Sonia Esterly Parry, Eta of Pennsylvania, Allegheny College  
Joseph Gregory Poluka, Delaware Valley Association  
Peter Howard Quimby, Beta of New Jersey, Princeton University  
Patricia Randolph, PBK Association of Western New York  
Ann-Marie Scheidt, Alpha Beta of New York, SUNY at Stony Brook  
Gary Schwartz, Chi of New York, Herbert H. Lehman College  
Sanford L. Segal, Iota of New York, University of Rochester  
Stefan John Senders, Zeta of New York, Hobart and William Smith Colleges  
Paul Fenton Shepard, Xi of Pennsylvania, University of Pittsburgh  
Malcolm Jay Sherman, Alpha Alpha of New York, SUNY at Albany  
J. Randolph Stonesifer, Gamma of Pennsylvania, Lafayette College  
Susan Rumsey Strong, Alpha Beta of New York, Alfred University  
Janet Ann Tighe, Delta of Pennsylvania, University of Pennsylvania  
Charles H. Tilly, Sidney Hook Memorial Award Recipient, Columbia University  
Amber Marie Vanderwarker, Pi of Pennsylvania, Muhlenberg College  
David Francis Venturo, The College of New Jersey  
Margaret B. Wendling, PBK Association of Delaware Valley  
Christopher M. Wolfgang, Rho of Pennsylvania, Temple University  
Pauline Yu, Senator

### **SOUTH ATLANTIC DISTRICT**

The meeting of the South Atlantic District of Phi Beta Kappa was called to order by Chair James Lightner at 4:05 p.m. on October 26, 2006. 12 associations and 33 chapters were represented. The minutes of the district meeting held on August 7, 2003, and recorded in the Phi Beta Kappa

*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

Bulletin of the 40<sup>th</sup> Triennial Council Meeting, were approved. The minutes were also published in the Fall 2003 District newsletter.

Those present:

Ronni B. Silett, Coastal Georgia-Carolina Association  
George B. Pruden, Coastal Georgia-Carolina Association  
Randy Harshbarger, Middle Georgia Association  
Mary Alice Morgan, Middle Georgia Association  
Jeanne Maddox Toungara, Howard University  
Franklin Glickman, Palm Beach County Association  
Steven F. Unti, Atlanta Alumni Association  
Ellen H. Massie, Richmond Association  
Valerie Neal, Washington DC Area Association  
James A. Anderson, Coastal Georgia – Carolina Association  
Curtis Clark, Morehouse College  
Bruce Pencek, Virginia Tech  
Louise Freeman Davis, Mary Baldwin College  
Murray Steinberg, Greater Baltimore Alumni Association  
Robert P. Lowman, University of North Carolina -Chapel Hill  
Ed Stansell, Emory University  
Sarah Stafford, College of William and Mary  
Alan Stolzenberg, West Virginia University  
Julie Campbell, Washington & Lee University  
Teresa Redd, Howard University  
Charles Blake, Shenandoah Valley Association  
Naomi Baron, American University  
Andrew Gordon, University of Florida  
Saundra Herndon Oyewole, Trinity University  
Thomas R. Wentworth, North Carolina State University  
Sandra Seckel, Tampa Bay Area Association  
Alvin W. Wolfe, Tampa Bay Area Association  
Abraham D. Lavender, South Florida Association  
Barbara L. Carter, Spelman College  
Grady Ballenger, Stetson University  
Catherine Griggs, Eckerd College  
Tim Brown, Wofford College  
Karlin Luedtke, University of Virginia  
Charlotte Johnson Jones, University of Mary Washington  
William T. Stuart, University of Maryland-College Park  
David Herlocker, McDaniel College  
Linn Donaldson, Georgetown University  
Mark Malin, Randolph-Macon College  
Brian W. Tague, Wake Forest University  
D. Eric Holt, University of South Carolina  
Calvert Johnson, Agnes Scott College  
Linda Hubert, Metropolitan Atlanta Association  
Jay M. Freyman, University of Maryland – Baltimore County  
Rosemary Hickey-Vargas, Florida International University  
Merle Schuh, Davidson College

## *MINUTES OF THE DISTRICT MEETINGS*

Alice Haddy, University of North Carolina – Greensboro  
Amy T. McCandless, Lowcountry Association of South Carolina  
Rhett T. George, Jr., Duke University  
David Darst, Florida State University  
Edward Eitches, Washington DC Association  
James Lightner, Chair, McDaniel College  
Hilda Fisher, Vice Chair, Goucher College  
Sandra Birch, Secretary-Treasurer, Virginia Tech

### Treasurer's Report

The balance in the operating account as of 9/29/06 was \$2,123.47. Total dues received for 2000-2006 totaled \$1,710, with dues (\$30) still owed by four universities. Dues of \$5/year were received from 58 chapters and associations. Five grants of \$300 were awarded in 2003-2006.

### Senate Activities

Harvey Klehr, District Senator, reviewed a number of activities of the Senate. He noted the work of the Committee on Chapters, which he chaired. The committee seeks to obtain more information from the Phi Beta chapters and to identify problems, such as low acceptance rates. Patrick Farmer has been hired to visit and work with chapters in the Society and to date has visited 50 chapters. Senator Klehr noted that  $\frac{3}{4}$  of our chapters are doing very well. Those struggling chapters, mostly at large universities, are hampered by such problems as lack of student-faculty contact and secretarial assistance. He noted that it is increasingly more difficult to get faculty to volunteer for service, especially young faculty who are concerned with tenure. The administrative staff of the Society is trying to make things easier for chapter officers by providing a better Web site and the means to do more tasks on-line.

The South Atlantic District ranks somewhere in the middle of the seven districts for acceptance rates. About 18% of our students decline (or do not respond to) Phi Beta Kappa's invitation. Half of the chapters in our district report a 100% acceptance rate.

Senator Klehr was applauded for his service to the Society and to our District over the past six years. He is not seeking re-election.

### Old Business

Vice Chair Hilda Fisher summarized some successful programs in the district, including those of her chapter at Goucher College. Valerie Neal, representing the Washington DC Association, shared some of her association's successful programming including a panel discussion entitled "Has Liberal Education of Ethics Failed in the Enron Age." Their young professionals group is developing a sense of community with monthly events such as rock climbing. Another successful association activity involves sharing the joy of reading with second graders and giving away books.

The delegates at the 2003 district meeting voted to fund proposals from chapters and associations that would promote awareness of Phi Beta Kappa at the high school, community college or college and university levels. In the past three years, five proposals were funded. A \$300 grant to the Central Carolinas Association was used to "seed" a scholarship/award program in five Central Carolina counties. In spring 2004, the first \$250 scholarship was awarded to a deserving junior (paid when the student enrolled in college) and a \$50 award went to a deserving teacher. A second grant was awarded to the Lowcountry Association, which supported 20-25 minute presentations at twelve of the best public and private high schools in their membership area. It





## *MINUTES OF THE DISTRICT MEETINGS*

Vice-chair: Sandra Birch, Virginia Tech  
Secretary-Treasurer: George Pruden, Coastal Georgia – Carolina Association  
Executive Committee: Teresa Redd, Howard University  
Catherine Griggs, Eckerd College

The meeting was adjourned at 5:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,  
Sandra Birch, Secretary-Treasurer

### **EAST CENTRAL DISTRICT**

The meeting of the East Central District of Phi Beta Kappa was called to order at 4:00 P.M. on Thursday, October 26, 2006, in the International F Room, Westin Peachtree Plaza Hotel, Atlanta, Georgia, with Vice Chair Gregory Gocek presiding.

41 members representing 35 chapters and associations of the district attended:

Gregory Gocek, Vice Chair, East Central District, Chicago Area Association  
Rosalie Vermette, Central Indiana Association (Indianapolis)  
William A. Hardesty, Miami University Chapter  
Mark A. Hasegawa Johnson, University of Illinois–Urbana-Champaign Chapter  
Alonzo Hamby, District Senator and Ohio University Chapter  
Judith F. Krug, Senator at Large and Chicago Area Association  
Jules Gleicher, Rockford College Chapter  
Patrick Farmer, PBK National Office, Chapter Relations Coordinator  
Daniel K. Holm, Kent State University Chapter  
Emily Tobeteau, Michigan State University Chapter  
David Radavich, East Central Illinois Association  
Mindy L. Hitchcock, Detroit Association  
John Nyenhuis, Purdue University Chapter  
Daniel M. Steffenson, Albion College Chapter  
James Pyle, Eastern Indiana Association  
Jill Van Newenhizem, Lake Forest College Chapter  
Bernie Estabrook, Illinois College Chapter  
Paul Pancella, Southwest Michigan Association  
Matthew S. Mingus, Western Michigan University Chapter  
Joe K. Fugate, Kalamazoo College Chapter  
Kathy McDaniel, Marietta College Chapter  
Sarah J. Heist, Kenyon College Chapter  
Joseph Musser, Ohio Wesleyan University Chapter  
Chuck Sokolik, Denison University Chapter  
Stephanie Little, Wittenberg University Chapter  
Tim Weber, guest of Chicago delegate  
Judi Strauss Lipkin, Chicago Area Association  
Lorayne Dollet, Chicago Area Association  
Eloise E. Clark, Senator at Large and Bowling Green State University Chapter  
Fred H. Smith, Loyola University-Chicago Chapter



## *MINUTES OF THE DISTRICT MEETINGS*

Senator Clark mentioned that any comments to the Committee on Qualifications regarding the outcome of the pending chapter assessments or future reviews were welcome up to 12:00 Noon on Friday, October 27. She then summarized some notable characteristics of the current chapter applicants, including growth in the sciences, new campus facilities, increase in diversity, and expansion of academic options via interdisciplinary programs, internships, and individualized majors. The Committee's aim is to identify the most deserving schools to shelter new Phi Beta Kappa chapters. It anticipates room for modest growth beyond the current roster of 272 chapters. The potential pool of eligible institutions is approximately 2000-2500 colleges/universities with four-year liberal arts programs. Geographic factors play a role in the composition of the Committee in order to rely upon a balanced structure of decision making, although site-related considerations are not determinative in composing the final slate of chapter applications presented at the Triennial. Colleagues experienced in accreditation review processes would be appropriate as nominees to this Committee.

Senator Krug indicated the Committee on Associations strives to link associations and chapters through mutually beneficial collaborations. This Committee's other important goals include enhancing the role of associations within the Society and enabling positive alumni identification with Phi Beta Kappa.

Vice Chair Gocek then discussed the May 20 District meeting. It included a report on the future of the liberal arts from Wabash College's Center for Inquiry in the Liberal Arts, an award presentation to University of Michigan Professor Buzz Alexander for applications of liberal education within the state prison system, and a round table discussion on enhancing Phi Beta Kappa's visibility. A detailed report is posted on the district Web site with a related notice sent to district contacts prior to the Triennial. Gocek mentioned that the feedback from all participants in a post-event survey was very positive.

In discussion, delegates from two organizations (Chicago Association and Michigan State chapter) mentioned they had not received advance notice of the district meeting. Gocek indicated this was due to outdated contact data from the National Society, with effective district communications a priority going forward. Gocek also noted Doug Baxter has said a new host will be needed for the district Web site in the medium term, after Baxter's pending retirement. Baxter will continue to provide his current Web site support in the interim. Gocek had asked Secretary John Churchill if the National Society could host the district Web site and received a favorable response. Over the coming months, transition arrangements and ultimate migration to that new electronic home will be addressed. Other future communications possibilities were also raised, such as launching a district newsletter, repeating a district meeting before the next Triennial, increasing tie-ins to Phi Beta Kappa programs such as the Visiting Scholar and Fellows Lectures, and/or pursuing one or more of the ideas offered by district meeting participants. Implementation was left to the judgment and dedication of the incoming district leadership team.

The May district meeting also was positive economically, netting a modest surplus of \$121.38. There is no district bank account, as there had been no district activities to finance. All prior moneys were donated to the National Society's building fund in 2000. Gocek has the May receipts in safekeeping in an interest bearing checking account, pending direction as to the district's allocation preferences. He also noted he attended a meeting of all district officers earlier that day, which included conversation on financing district activities. Prior to his discussing related specifics, Patrick Farmer at our district meeting announced on behalf of the National Society that it was just decided to grant all seven districts a budget of \$2500 each to underwrite suitable activities within the period between Triennials. Gocek opined that our existing surplus



## MINUTES OF THE DISTRICT MEETINGS

Gamma of Missouri: Patrick McCarthy  
Gamma-Delta of Wisconsin: Kurt Krebsbach  
Greater Milwaukee Association: Scott Enk  
National Office, Awards Coordinator: Sam Esquith  
Northeast Missouri Association: Carol Race, District Senator  
Zeta of Iowa: Thomas Beell  
Zeta of Minnesota: Arthur Guetter  
Zeta of Wisconsin: Julia C. Paulk

Chair Carol Race described the e-Community being established for the District. Participants will not receive e-mail communications advising them of new discussion messages, but will have to go to the e-Community Web site. The North Central District is the “guinea pig” for the Society to try out the utility and workability of an e-Community. One purpose of establishing an e-Community is to share “Best Practices.”

The minutes of the District meeting at the Fortieth Triennial Council were presented. Scott Enk made the following amendments (in italics below), in the section on “the issue on how to make freshmen aware of PBK”:

“Scott Enk said that his association sends representatives to the University of Wisconsin-*Milwaukee* to urge students to join associations...”

“Scott Enk said that at his undergraduate university the Honors program told students how to ~~become~~ *qualify* for PBK. *At another institution, he noted,* a Phi Society was established to recognize freshmen as pre-PBK students who were told ‘they must earn their next two letters.’ *In other cases, he added,* ~~also~~ plaques with student’s names were displayed each year.”

The amended minutes were then approved, *viva voce, nem. con.*

Carol Race then called for nominations for the positions of District Chair and Secretary. She explained the primary duty of these two officers is to convene the District meeting at the Triennial Council. New duties will include administering a fund provided by the National Office of \$2500.00 during the next triennium and holding discussion with the e-Community on what activities this fund should support. Scott Enk inquired as to the time and travel commitments either position will now entail. Carol Race indicated that there would be a time commitment, and perhaps a travel commitment, because of the \$2500.00 fund, but it is unclear at present how extensive the commitment would be.

Calvin VanNiewaal nominated Carol Race for District Chair and was seconded by Robert Entenmann. No other nominations were made and a unanimous ballot was cast for her election.

Robert Entenmann nominated Judith Sebesta as District secretary and was seconded by Marjorie Bjornstad. No other nominations were made and an unanimous ballot was cast for her election.

Carol Race observed that the District may need a new position, that of treasurer, to handle the \$2500.00 the Washington office has provided. Nancy Pope nominated Chett Breed as District treasurer and was seconded by Steven Kiefer. No other nominations were made and an unanimous ballot was cast for his election.



## *MINUTES OF THE DISTRICT MEETINGS*

collaboration between a chapter and an association is a real possibility, but not all chapters have an association nearby and an association may be too small to help. Marjorie Bjornstad stated her chapter conducted a campaign among UWM PBK faculty, staff, and alumni to acquire contributions of \$60.00 each to help underwrite the cost of initiation for new members; the chapter's letter of invitation to membership does tell students that they can ask for help in paying the fee. Many chapters with problems in acceptance rates are in the western U. S. and are in large state institutions. Ann Warren stated that her chapter provides the costs for key, banquet, and initiation fee, but the chapter's budget is nonexistent at this point. It is debating whether to raise dues and no longer buys the key. Carol Race said some, but not many, of the other chapters buy the keys.

Carol Race asked for reaction to on-line annual reporting. The general response was that the registration for the triennial Council went smoothly and that putting individuals' agendas in their packets was a good idea.

She also raised the question of inter-triennial District communication. Upon being asked whether their chapter or association had a Web site, about 50% present raised their hands. Nancy Pope suggested that the District Web page contain links to the Web pages of chapters and associations. Carol Race stated that the Society expects to do this with its Web page. She also stated that she had received only two items for the District newsletter. Judith Sebesta said she had not received any information to post on the District Web site.

Other Business: Chett Breed stated that because of economic problems, hosting a Visiting Scholar would be difficult. Could there be a District Visiting Scholar program if the scholar was someone near a chapter or association? Carol Race suggested this kind of visit might be the kind to receive a grant from the District's \$2500.00. Chett Breed added that such a visiting program would be a good opportunity for younger faculty to gain speaking experience, especially if the district could recruit two or three members from each chapter and determine their topics and the times they were available; they could be hosted in a private home to cut costs. Other possibilities for a program, Carol Race added, were to have the most senior chapter/association member speak, or have Visiting Faculty from other institutions speak. On her campus three community ministers, who were members of Phi Beta Kappa, put on a symposium on how liberal education prepared them for their calling. Judith Sebesta added that speaker could come from associations, who might also speak at initiation ceremonies. Scott Enk commented that his association's members travel outside their immediate area to speak, and also sponsor scholarships through donations and investments; one hundred attended the Founders' Day dinner and many of these made donations.

Calvin VanNiewaal then advised that chapters and associations needed to be sure they had added, as the Society's Finance Committee recommended, the language for incorporation, especially re: 501C. Nancy Pope added that each chapter and association needed to tell the National office that it added this language.

Carol Race was asked to clarify why the fees increased. She said the problem was the financial slump after 9/11, which would have necessitated drawing from the Endowment if the fees were not increased. Michael Gauger advised those present that they should have received a copy of the Spellings Report in their packet. Someone asked if it was necessary for PBK to be located in such an expensive location and suggested that the Society move to a campus instead of Washington DC. Carol explained also that the Society must be in DC despite the cost of property if it wanted to influence policy. Nancy Pope concurred, stating that such entities as the AAUP were there and, similar to PBK, influenced policy.





## *MINUTES OF THE DISTRICT MEETINGS*

Secretary Mary Meredith greeted all in attendance and introduced Scott Lurding, Associate Secretary, from the national office. In an announcement that responded to widespread concerns at the district officers' meeting earlier that day, Lurding reported that the National Office would allocate \$2500 in funding per district to help fund district activities, for example, district seminars and speakers during the next three years.

The minutes of the August 7, 2003, South Central District meeting in Seattle were distributed. The omission of one member's name from the list of attendees was noted. The minutes were approved as corrected.

The nominees for South Central District Senator, current Senator Charles Adams and Susan Hagan, were introduced and each spoke briefly. Adams reported on activities of the Senate, expressing excitement at the progress that had been made over his six years of tenure. He noted that PBK initiation rates were rising, many Web site improvements had been made, and above all, the stabilization of PBK finances in recent years had greatly improved the atmosphere of the Society. Hagan spoke about her desire, if elected, to help promote the involvement of a critical mass of members in chapters through improved communication. She stated that the key would be improved use of technology to encourage communication among members.

Secretary Meredith asked attendees to comment on special projects in their chapters or associations that might be of interest to others. Responses included:

- Stephen Miller, University of the South Chapter: Regular use of Visiting Scholars, developing relationships with Associations in the area.
- Rob Kouns, University of Texas at Austin Chapter: Great books program, lecture series on the theme of "the essence of a liberal education," shared activities with area chapters and associations.
- Charles Caldwell, Association of Greater Houston: Scholarship program for 76 area high schools, promoting liberal arts study and PBK.
- Judith Crutcher, Kentuckiana Association: Book awards in local high schools, PBK members at local high school honor days, collaboration with the University of Louisville for a PBK lecture series.

Ideas were shared for promotion of PBK to students: Jeffrey Kovac, University of Tennessee Chapter, suggested that high school students at Governor's School programs be introduced to Phi Beta Kappa. Philip Johnson, Baylor University Chapter, suggested a reception for college freshman, particularly National Merit Scholars, to present opportunities for high achieving students, including Phi Beta Kappa. Susan Hagan put in a word for the Visiting Scholar Program, noting that linking a Visiting Scholar with a university lecture series could increase publicity of the lecture and visibility for Phi Beta Kappa.

Charles Caldwell expressed curiosity that very few institutions west of the Mississippi utilized the Visiting Scholars Program. Scott Lurding replied that this might be due to the generally large size of schools in the west, that larger schools were much less likely to use the Visiting Scholar Program.

Secretary Meredith then brought up the question of effective communication within Phi Beta Kappa and expressed the need for better use of the Web. A lively discussion ensued on a variety



## *MINUTES OF THE DISTRICT MEETINGS*

Stephen Canham, University of Hawaii at Manoa  
Stanford J. Cohn, Arizona State University  
John Doner, University of California, Santa Barbara; Western District Senator  
Robert C. Ferguson, Washington State University  
E. Nicholas Genovese, San Diego State University  
Philip Gilbertson, University of the Pacific  
Richard Haesly, California State University, Long Beach  
Bette Napoli Harris, Southern California Association  
Barbara Horwitz, University of California, Davis  
Daniel Leach, Puget Sound Association  
Maureen McRae Levy, Occidental College  
Ted Lindeman, Colorado College  
C. Scott Littleton, Southern California Association  
Robbie McMillian, Inland Empire Association  
Steven Morics, University of Redlands  
Roger Nelsen, Lewis and Clark College  
Eric Nye, University of Wyoming  
Kate Ostrom, Puget Sound Association  
Jean Paule, Southern California Association  
Jerry Peterson, University of Colorado  
Louise Richards, University of Washington  
Todd H. Sammons, University of Hawaii at Manoa  
Joanne Sandstrom, Northern California Association  
Tamara Shaw, San Diego Association  
Floyd Shiery, University of Utah  
Peter Stansky, Stanford University  
Wayne Steinmetz, Pomona College  
Donald L. Tempkin, Tucson Area Association  
Carrie Washburn, University of Puget Sound

### Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 4:00 P.M. by Bette Napoli Harris, chair. After introduction of Jean Paule, secretary, she spoke in appreciation of the assistance to the district by the Society staff, naming in particular John Churchill, Cameron Curtis, and Erik Meier.

### Minutes

The minutes of the meeting of August 7, 2005, as published in the Council Bulletin of the Fortieth Triennial Council, and as made available online and in hard copy at this meeting, were approved upon motion of Scott Littleton, seconded by Barry Balof.

### District Newsletter

Chair Harris spoke of the preparation process of contacting by e-mail those on the contact list provided by Erik Meier and her gratitude for the responses as recorded in the document that was placed online by Ray Hendess of the Northern California Association who has made his expertise available for this project over the past nine years. A printed summary of highlights from the newsletter, including the letters therein from Chair Harris and Western District Senator John E. Doner, was distributed at this meeting.



## *MINUTES OF THE DISTRICT MEETINGS*

Concern for low acceptance of invitations to join Phi Beta Kappa was a major discussion topic. Recognizing privacy issues, ways must be found for reaching the invitees to be sure recipients understand the significance of Phi Beta Kappa membership. In large institutions departments should find ways to contact their majors who have qualified for the honor. Another proposal was for a chapter to host a social event to acquaint the invitees with the merits of Phi Beta Kappa membership.

The question was raised as to what reason students give to decline an invitation to Phi Beta Kappa. Dr. Churchill replied that the national office has conducted surveys on this issue. Some students have never heard of the organization, or they cannot distinguish between Phi Beta Kappa and any other organization with Greek letters. Some institutions have had difficulty in reaching the student in time for a reply. The national office, he said, is continuing to look for ways to assist chapters in inducing students to join. A response was that after the national office receives the chapter list of invitees, the Society might send a follow-up letter with an attractive enclosure, a printed piece that is available to chapters that request it.

Early outreach is important in getting the word to students about Phi Beta Kappa even before they enter college. Grants to high achieving secondary school students is one way of getting the Phi Beta Kappa name before them, their classmates, and teachers.

Senator Doner referred to the problem in the Western District of the many large universities where there are many factors that relate to low instances of acceptance of the honor. Many students are first in their family to attend college. Publicity in hometown newspapers and defrayment of part of the initiation fee were mentioned. There may be ways for associations to assist chapters in promoting an awareness of membership significance.

The spiraling costs of higher education need to be addressed as a serious issue before the Society and its members, according to one who spoke. A response was that there are many funds available for college and university students that may not be generally known.

### Adjournment

Prior to adjournment, Chair Harris spoke again in commendation of the valuable assistance of Ray Hendess to the preparation of the District newsletter.

Upon motion of Scott Littleton, commendation was expressed to Bette Harris and Jean Paule for their efforts in behalf of the Western District these past three years.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:00 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,  
Jean Paule, Secretary



*CONFERENCE OF ASSOCIATION DELEGATES*

Anna Blount	Southern California
Senator Carol Race	Northeast Missouri (North Central District Senator)
Tamara Shaw	San Diego
Ellen H. Massie	Richmond
Randy Harshbarger	Middle Georgia
Sanora Seckel	Tampa Bay
Alvin Wolfe	Tampa Bay
Elizabeth Swenson	Cleveland
Franklin Glickman	Palm Beach County
Jean Golden	New York City
Abraham D. Lavender	South Florida
Murray Steinberg	Greater Baltimore

Gauger announced that Conference Chairman Barbara Marmorstein was unable to attend the 41<sup>st</sup> Triennial because of recent surgery. Gauger relayed Marmorstein's best wishes, and commended her *in absentia* for the many years of service she has given to Phi Beta Kappa.

Following delegate introductions, the minutes of the Conference meeting of August 7, 2003, in Seattle, Washington, were unanimously APPROVED as submitted by MOTION of Steve Houghton with a SECOND by Ellen Massey.

Report of the Chairman:

Gauger delivered Marmorstein's report that had been sent via e-mail on October 14, 2006. In the report, Marmorstein said that it has been an honor and a pleasure to serve as Conference Chairman. She expressed pride in the accomplishments of PBK associations during the past six years in which she has been an officer, first as Secretary and then as Conference Chairman. She said that during that time, the associations have gained in scope, strength, importance and esteem. She noted that when she had attended her first Senate meeting with Aubrey Farb, then Conference Chairman, they were not invited to take part in the entire meeting; rather, they were expected to leave after presenting their report. Now, Conference officers are not only allowed to stay for the entire meeting, but allowed to participate, as well.

In her report, Marmorstein said that during her time in office, she helped found two associations in Florida – the PBK Association of Southwest Florida and the PBK Association of Palm Beach County. She had also represented the associations at the PBK chapter installations of members at the University of Miami and at Florida International University, delivering a presentation concerning the important role that associations play -- allowing Phi Betes the opportunity to take part in PBK for the rest of their lives. In addition, she urged associations to send a representative to speak at PBK chapter installations in their area.

Marmorstein wished to note that two association members with whom she has worked had been nominated to the PBK Senate – Arline Bronzaft, who is currently a member of the Senate and who had served previously as Conference Chairman, and Joseph Poluka, a former President of the Delaware Valley Association.

She also wished to state her support for the Conference Secretary, Michael Gauger, who has been proposed as a candidate for Conference Chairman at the 41<sup>st</sup> Triennial Council, and for Bette Napoli Harris, who has been proposed as a candidate for Conference Secretary. She said that the Nominating Committee would report on candidates for the offices at the Conference meeting at Triennial, and afterward, nominations would be made from the floor.





## *CONFERENCE OF ASSOCIATION DELEGATES*

no provision is made for such an office in the PBK Bylaws. Mr. Poluka referred to Bylaw 6, paragraph 5, which states “A chair and a secretary for the accredited associations shall be elected to serve for three years by the association delegates at the triennial Council.”

Littleton made the MOTION to abolish the office of Conference Vice Chairman, since the Senate does not recognize this office. Poluka provided a SECOND. Discussion followed, after which Littleton WITHDREW his amendment.

Littleton then MOVED that the Vice Chairman office be abolished, unless the PBK Society’s Bylaw 6 is amended to include the office of Vice Chairman, and that the Vice Chairman be authorized to attend Senate meetings if the Chairman or Secretary is unable to attend. George Pruden provided a SECOND. The motion PASSED.

Responding to various questions and comments, Krug recommended drafting a resolution to amend Bylaw 6, and suggested consulting with the Committee on Resolutions, regarding specific language.

Curtis commented that when Marmorstein was unable to attend the Senate meetings in the past, she participated by conference call.

### Election of Officers:

Gauger introduced Poluka, Chairman of the Nominating Committee. Poluka expressed his appreciation for the work of Marmorstein, and thanked the other members of the Nominating Committee: Senator Carol Race and Senator Arline Bronzaft. Poluka noted that Bronzaft would not be able to attend this Triennial Council, as her husband was ill.

Poluka submitted the names of Gauger for Conference Chairman and Napoli Harris for Conference Secretary. He asked for nominations from the floor, but none were forthcoming.

Demetrios Melis MOVED to close nominations. Littleton provided a SECOND and the motion PASSED.

Poluka MOVED that the slate of Conference Officers, Gauger as Chairman and Napoli Harris as Secretary, be accepted. Judy Crutcher SECONDED the motion, which PASSED.

Eitches suggested the nomination of a “Vice Chairman in Waiting,” in the event that the Bylaws are amended to provide for the office of a Conference Vice Chairman. Eitches nominated Christel MacDonald of the D.C. Area Association for “Vice Chairman in Waiting.” Valerie Neal offered her approval.

Crutcher nominated Joseph Poluka for “Vice Chairman in Waiting.” Rosalie Vermette offered her approval. However, Poluka declined the office, as he is a candidate for both Senator and for Chairman of the Middle Atlantic District. However, he asked for support of MacDonald’s nomination if the office is allowed by amendment to the Bylaws.

Eitches MOVED to approve MacDonald as Vice Chairman, if the Bylaws are amended accordingly. Vermette provided a SECOND. The motion PASSED.

### Senate Candidates:

Gauger called attention to the following Senate candidates who are association representatives: Eitches, nominee for Senator of the South Atlantic District; Bronzaft, candidate for Senator at



*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

**THE PHI BETA KAPPA SOCIETY**

**OFFICERS**

Allison Blakely, *President*  
Judith Krug, *Vice President*  
John Churchill, *Secretary*  
John Page, *Treasurer*

**SENATORS**

***TERM ENDING IN 2009***

Bruce Barrett, *Kansas*  
Professor of Physics, University of  
Arizona  
Arline Bronzaft, *Hunter*  
Professor Emerita of Psychology,  
Lehman College, CUNY  
Fred H. Cate, *Stanford*  
Professor of Law,  
Ira C. Batman Faculty Fellow,  
Director, Center for Applied Cybersecurity  
Research, Indiana University  
John Donor, *Pomona*  
Associate Professor of Mathematics,  
University of California-Santa Barbara  
Theopolis Fair, *Fisk*  
Associate Professor of History,  
La Salle University  
Kathleen Gensheimer, *Pennsylvania State*  
State Epidemiologist,  
Maine Department of Human Services  
Madeline E. Glick, *New York*  
Retired, VP and Fixed Income Manager,  
Loomis, Sayles & Company  
Alonzo L. Hamby, *Ohio*  
Distinguished Professor of  
History, Ohio University  
Donald S. Lamm, *Yale*  
Former Chairman and President,  
W. W. Norton & Company, Inc.  
Kurt Olsson, *Idaho*  
Associate Provost, University of Idaho  
Carol Race, *Indiana*  
Retired Director of Instructional  
Technology, Truman State University  
Catherine Rudder, *Emory*  
Professor and Director, Masters Program  
in Public Policy, George Mason University  
Pauline Yu, *Harvard*  
President, American Council of Learned  
Societies

***TERM ENDING IN 2012***

Danielle S. Allen, *Princeton*  
Professor of Classics, Political Science,  
Committee on Social Thought, University  
of Chicago  
Catherine White Berheide, *Beloit*  
Professor of Sociology, Skidmore College  
Allison Blakely, *Oregon*  
Professor of European and Comparative  
History, Boston University  
Joseph W. Gordon, *Amherst*  
Dean of Undergraduate Education, Deputy  
Dean, Yale College  
Anthony Grafton, *Chicago*  
Henry Putnam University Professor of  
History and Chair, Council of the  
Humanities, Princeton University  
Susan K. Hagen, *Gettysburg College*  
Mary Collett Munger Professor of English,  
Birmingham-Southern College  
Judith F. Krug, *Pittsburgh*  
Director, Office for Intellectual Freedom,  
Executive Director, Freedom to Read  
Foundation, American Library Association  
James E. Lightner, *Western Maryland*  
Professor of Mathematics Emeritus,  
College Historian, McDaniel College  
Paul Lukacs, *Kenyon*  
Chair, Professor of English, Loyola  
College in Maryland  
Katherine R. Soule, *Amherst*  
Director of Budget and Fiscal Affairs for  
the Faculty of Arts & Sciences, Dartmouth  
College  
Don J. Wyatt, *Beloit*  
Professor of History, Middlebury College



*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

**THE PHI BETA KAPPA FELLOWS**

**Board of Directors**  
**2007–2008**

**Officers**

Murray Drabkin, *President*  
David Alexander, *Vice President*  
Myra S. Hatterer, *Vice President*  
Jack B. Williams, *Secretary-Treasurer*

**Directors**

John Bassett	Francine L. Kupferman
John Brademas	Jonathan E. Lewis
Fred H. Cate	Michael Lubin
John Churchill	L. Jay Oliva
Joel O. Conarroe	Alfred R. Schneider
Claire Gaudiani	Malcolm B. Smith
William E. Kelly	Philip S. Winterer

**Honorary Directors**

Charles F. Barber	George P. Jenkins
Robert C. Birney	George C. Seward
Alvin Edelman	Herbert P. Shyer
Allan W. Ferrin	



*The PHI BETA KAPPA Society*  
*COUNCIL BULLETIN*

**THE PHI BETA KAPPA SOCIETY STAFF**

John Churchill, *Secretary*  
Scott Lurding, *Associate Secretary*

William Colella, *Mail Services & Building Management*  
Cameron Curtis, *Society Affairs*  
Cara Engel, *Chapter Relations*  
Sam Esquith, *Alumni Relations & Awards*  
Kelly Gerald, *Public Relations*  
Jared Hughes, *Legacy Planning*  
Doris Lawrence, *Membership Services*  
Dilia Linares, *Accounting*  
Brenda Marsh-Irby, *Reception*  
Mallori Merrandino, *Research*  
Lucinda Morales, *Administrative Assistant to the Secretary*  
Helen Nash, *Accounting*  
Kathy Navascués, *Visiting Scholar Program & Fellows Lectureship*  
Margaret Roller, *Controller*  
Shun Zhang, *Information Technology*